Index

Resolved: The United States federal government should substantially increase alternative energy incentives in the United States.

T:Substantial

Substantial means to be not merely nominal
Words and Phrases '64 (40 W&P 759)
The words "outward, open, actual, visible, substantial, and exclusive," in connection with a change of possession, mean substantially the same thing. They mean not concealed; not hidden; exposed to view; free from concealment, dissimulation, reserve, or disguise; in full existence; denoting that which not merely can be, but is opposed to potential, apparent, constructive, and imaginary; veritable; genuine; certain; absolute; real at present time, as a matter of fact, not merely nominal; opposed to form; actually existing; true; not including admitting, or pertaining to any others; undivided; sole; opposed to inclusive.

Substantial" means of considerable value or importance.
Words and Phrases in 90 (1990 Pocket Part, p. 212).
Considerable importance, value, degree, amount or extent.

Substantial = important
American Heritage Dictionary office edition 19**83**
Substantial: of real worth and importance, not imaginary, real

T: Increase Not Create

A. Definition: Increasing alternative energy is not creating a new policy.
Random House Webster's College Dictionary (Second edition), **2000**
increase (v. in krest; n. hi/1as), v., -crossed, -creeping, n. —v.t. 1. to make greater, as in number, size, strength, or quality; augment: to increase one's knowledge. —

B. Violation: the affirmative creates a new policy. Specifically, they [insert explanation]

C. Reasons to Prefer:

Ground- there are an infinite number of new policies that could be passed. This explodes the research burden because there is no wa to predict what policies the aff team could create. Building on previous policies gurantees stable ground because those policies are in place. This is clearly the ground that is dictated by the resolution because if it was supposed to be about new policies it would say create.

Education-Current policies are already in the literature. Having policies that are based in large amounts of literature is crucial to creating a full understanding of the policy. Even if they have solvency evidence for their new policy there is overall less evidence about the policy and none of the evidence can be empirical because the policy is not in effect. Talking about empirical arguments for and against policy provides better argumentation and critical thinking about evidence, because experts in the field have already examined the policy.

D. Voter: T is a voter for competitive equity and competing interpretations.

T: Increase - Definitions

Increase is distinct from create

Words and Phrases, 1960, 381.
"Increased," as used in West's Ann.Cal. Const. art. 12, s.11 providing that the stock and bonded indebtedness of corporations shall not be increased without the consent of the person holding the larger amount of the stock, does not include or apply to the first creation of bonded indebtedness. To give it such meaning would be to inject into the provision the word "create."

Increase-make greater / progressively greater
Merriam-Webster Online Dictionary 2005-06 accessed 7-13-06 http://www.m-w.com/dictionary/Increasing
intransitive verb
1 : to become progressively greater (as in size, amount, number, or intensity)
2 : to multiply by the production of young
transitive verb
1 : to make greater : AUGMENT
2 obsolete : ENRICH
- in·creas·able /-'krE-s&-b&l, -"krE-/ adjective
- in·creas·er noun

Greater in quality.
Random House Webster's College Dictionary (Second edition), 2000
increase (v. in krest; n. hi/1as), v., -crossed, -creeping, n. —v.t. 1. to make greater, as in number, size, strength, or quality; augment: to increase one's knowledge. —

Increase means pre-supposing
Corpus Juris Secundum '44 (P 546)
"Increase" As a Verb. The term presupposes the existence in some measure, or to some extent, of something which may be enlarged.

"Increase" means to make greater in amount or degree.
Oxford English Dictionary in 71 (1971, pp. 181-182)
To cause to wax or grow; **to make greater in amount or degree**, to augment, enlarge, extend, intensify.

Topicality – Incentives – Emissions Trading

Our evidence draws a bright line between trading and taxation – only taxes operate as an incentive.
Washington and Lee Law Review, '98
["Is emissions Trading and Economic Incentive Program" Spring, 1998, http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3655/is_199804/ai_n8791954/pg_22]

A tax, unlike emissions trading, may offer a continuous incentive for environmental improvement. The **operator can always reduce the tax by making additional innovations until the taxed pollution reaches the zero level**, at least in theory.244 A significant tax may be necessary to secure management work on developing and implementing innovation.2' But **the tax may provide an adequate incentive to implement further control anytime an innovation shifts the marginal cost of control to a level less than that of the tax.**246 If the government adopts pollution taxes, it must enhance monitoring of emissions and enforcement activities." Otherwise, it may allow taxable pollution to remain untaxed.24 Hence, an enforcement difficulty remains.

Emissions trading not an incentive.
Washington and Lee Law Review, '98
["Is emissions Trading and Economic Incentive Program" Spring, 1998, http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3655/is_199804/ai_n8791954/pg_22]

Part IV develops a true economic incentives theory to describe the requisites for programs that will actually induce more innovation and continuous improvement than traditional regulation or emissions trading.31 **Pollution taxes may provide continuous incentives for innovation** in theory, but taxes rely upon government decision making as the stimulant for reductions.32 Making **economic competition to reduce pollution the source of economic incentives, rather than the magnitude of politically-determined fees may do more to stimulate innovation and continuous improvement**.**33 Emissions trading has limited utility, because it makes little use of economic incentives**, suffers from many of the impediments that frustrate the traditional regulatory system, and creates new enforcement and design difficulties.34

Emissions trading not an incentive – it is command and control
Washington and Lee Law Review, '98
["Is emissions Trading and Economic Incentive Program" Spring, 1998, http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3655/is_199804/ai_n8791954/pg_22]

This failure to define economic incentives leaves unsupported the suggestion that emissions trading realizes environmental goals through economic incentives, but that traditional regulations (rules that limit discharges of pollutants into the environment without allowing trading) do not. Both traditional regulation and emissions trading rely upon the threat of a monetary penalty to secure compliance with government commands setting emission limitations.3 **Perhaps neither traditional regulation nor emissions trading should be considered economic incentive programs, because both rely upon government commands**.4 Or perhaps both should be considered economic incentive programs, because monetary penalties provide a crucial economic incentive in both systems.

Topicality – Incentive – Deregulation

Incentive is ay program that regulates or deregulates, but requires government action.
Washington and Lee Law Review, '98
["Is emissions Trading and Economic Incentive Program" Spring, 1998,
http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3655/is_199804/ai_n8791954/pg_22]

A few days prior to Clinton's speech on climate change, the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) released its proposal to address interstate pollution, an important impediment to delivering healthful air under the 1990 Amendments to the Clean Air Act.'3 The EPA, predictably, called for an interstate emissions trading program.'4 This Article develops a theory of economic incentives. **Any program to regulate or to deregulate creates economic incentives**.'5 The **programs referred to as "economic incentive" programs all envision a substantial governmental role of some kind**. That is why lawyers, experts in law, write about them.'6

Moreover, traditional environmental law creates free markets. Law performs a fundamental role in creating markets generally," and environmental law is no different. For example, laws requiring businesses to keep promises to customers and suppliers (contract) make commercial transactions possible.18 Laws allowing owners to forbid nonowners from using "their" property create a need for nonowners to buy or rent property from owners.'9 Traditional environmental law creates markets, just as surely as contract and property law create markets Za It establishes obligations that cause a polluter to hire people (or pay contractors) to clean-up dirty facilities.21 This creates markets in pollution control technology, techniques, and cleaner processes, just as obligations to fulfill contractual promises and refrain from appropriating private property create markets in goods consumers wish to have. Any meaningful theory of economic incentives must address several key questions. **What precisely does a proposed program provide incentives to do? Who will create the incentives? A theory that focuses on these questions helps analyze claims that emissions trading offers free market-like dynamic advantages - inducement of innovation and continuous environmental improvement - central to its attractiveness. It clarifies the advantages and disadvantages of traditional regulation. It shows that much more useful things can be done with the concept of economic incentives than trade emission reduction obligations**. A theory of economic incentives may help create more dynamic and effective environmental law.

Topicality – Incentives – Posotive/Negative

Requiring payment of transition costs is an incentive.
Washington and Lee Law Review, '98
["Is emissions Trading and Economic Incentive Program" Spring, 1998, http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3655/is_199804/ai_n8791954/pg_22]

One could craft an "environmental competition law" requiring polluters to pay any costs that competitors incur in reducing pollution plus a substantial premium, thereby creating a significant incentive to be among the first to reduce pollution.us An environmental competition law directly attacks a fundamental problem with existing free market incentives: the polluting firm must absorb any clean-up costs. Because the firm does not experience all of the costs of pollution itself (most are externalized and felt by the general public) it rarely pays to clean-up.259 If firms could systematically externalize the costs of clean-up without substantial administrative intervention, just as they externalize the cost of pollution, then even a fairly modest premium might create adequate incentives to control pollution.

Fees and penalties are incentives.
Washington and Lee Law Review, '98
["Is emissions Trading and Economic Incentive Program" Spring, 1998, http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3655/is_199804/ai_n8791954/pg_22]

Governments have designed programs that use negative economic incentives to fund positive economic incentives. New Zealand addressed the depletion of its fishery by imposing fees on fishing, a negative economic incentive, and using revenue from these fees to pay some fishermen to retire, a positive economic incentive.2z This may reduce pressure on the fish if fees are high enough.**253 The California legislature has considered a program, Drive +, that imposes a fee upon consumers purchasing an energy inefficient or high pollution vehicle**.4 **The proceeds fund a rebate on the purchase of an energy efficient vehicle or low polluting vehicle.255 Similarly, New Hampshire officials have proposed an "Industry Average Performance System" that redistributes pollution taxes to the polluting industry in ways that favor lower emissions**.256

Incentives can be positive or negative.
Washington and Lee Law Review, '98
["Is emissions Trading and Economic Incentive Program" Spring, 1998, http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3655/is_199804/ai_n8791954/pg_22]

The law can apply either positive economic incentives, such as revenue increases or cost decreases, or negative economic incentives, such as revenue decreases or cost increases, to polluters. This reveals a possibility that has received too little attention."' Negative economic incentives can fund positive economic incentives.

Clear distinction between positive and negative incentives for production – positive incentive must be rewards.
Pryor, 84
[Frederic, "Incentives in Manufacturing the carrot and the stick" Monthly Labor Review, July 1984, Research Summaries, http://www.bls.gov/opub/mlr/1984/07/rpt3full.pdf]

The study focuses on both positive and negative incentives, that is, **the carrot and the stick**. **Positive incentive plans tie the compensation of the individual** workers directly with the work that is done and are of two basic types: Individual incentives include piecework or various types of bonuses for exceeding norms; Group incentives tie the bonus to the performance of the group as a whole, for example, profit-sharing plans, stock ownership plans, bonuses based on aggregative indicators such as production or productivity . **Negative incentives are threats or actual use of punishment, including financial penalties . These include the hiring of additional supervisors to monitor the performance of workers or firing workers for poor performance** . Although some borderline cases can be cited for which it is difficult to determine whether a particular incentive is positive or negative, in most cases the distinction should be relatively clear.

Topicality – Incentives – Positive / Negative

Negative incentives discourage certain actions.
Conventional on Biological Diversity, '7
["Negative Incentive Measures" Convection on the Biological Diversity, 6-1-2007, http://www.cbd.int/incentives/negative.shtml]

Negative incentive measures or disincentives are mechanisms designed to discourage activities that are harmful for biodiversity. Examples of disincentives are user fees or pollution taxes.

The guidelines for selecting appropriate and complementary measures, contained in the Proposals for the Design and Implementation of Incentive Measures endorsed by the sixth meeting of the Conference of the Parties, underline that disincentives continue to be an important tool for ensuring the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity, and that they can be used in combination with positive incentives.

Topicality - Incentives = Tax Breaks

Tax breaks for renewable energy is an incentive.
North Carolina Department of Revenue, '7
["Guidelines for Determining Tax Credits for Investing in Renewable Energy" http://www.dor.state.nc.us/practitioner/individual/directives/renewableenergyguidelines.html]

To promote and encourage the conservation of non-renewable energy through the increased use of renewable energy, the 1977 session of the North Carolina General Assembly enacted legislation that provided tax incentives in the form of a tax credit for the construction or installation of a solar energy system to heat, cool, or provide hot water to a building in North Carolina. Throughout the years, other tax credits encouraging investment in renewable energy sources were enacted. These included installation of a hydroelectric generator, installation of solar energy equipment for the production of heat or electricity in manufacturing or service processes of a person's business, installation of a wind energy device, and construction of a methanol gas facility. These credits were statutorily provided in both the corporation and individual income tax laws and had different calculation methods and maximum credit amounts.

Clean automobile fuel subsides are incentives.
Senate Committee on Finance, '5
["Description of the Energy Policy Tax Incentives Act of 2005" June 16, 2005, http://www.house.gov/jct/x-44-05.pdf]

Certain costs of qualified clean-fuel vehicle may be expensed and deducted when such property is placed in service (sec. 179A). Qualified clean-fuel vehicle property includes motor vehicles that use certain clean-burning fuels (natural gas, liquefied natural gas, liquefied petroleum gas, hydrogen, electricity and any other fuel at least 85 percent of which is methanol, ethanol, any other alcohol or ether).32 The maximum amount of the deduction is $50,000 for a truck or van with a gross vehicle weight over 26,000 pounds or a bus with seating capacities of at least 20 adults; $5,000 in the case of a truck or van with a gross vehicle weight between 10,000 and 26,000 pounds; and $2,000 in the case of any other motor vehicle. Qualified electric vehicles do not qualify for the clean-fuel vehicle deduction. The deduction is reduced to 25 percent of the otherwise allowable deduction in 2006 and is unavailable for purchases after December 31, 2006.

T: Alternative Energy- Conservation and Efficiency not T

Alternative Energy is distinct from conservation and efficiency efforts

Byner, research associate at natural resources law center Unv of Colorado law school, **2K2**
(Gary C. "The National Energy Policy: Assessing Energy Policy Choices" University of Colorado Law Review 73 U. Colo. L. Rev. 341 Spring)
It is difficult to predict what recommendations Congress will eventually enact, and the Interior, Energy, and other departments will implement. The policy process will be shaped by temperatures and demand for gasoline, global events affecting the stability of global oil markets, the nation's war against terrorism and its impact on the United States' relations with oil exporting nations, long-term issues such as the evolution of the threat of climate change and other environmental concerns, and other factors difficult to predict. **Exploring how well the problem of energy is defined provides a useful starting point, since that is a critical step in the development of effective policies**. **A key issue is the interaction of the current sources of energy (primarily fossil fuels), with options for conservation, improved efficiency, and development of alternative energy sources that are central to the shift towards a more ecologically sustainable economy.**

T: Alternative Energy = Renewables

Renewable s are an alternative energy

Rabe et al., Professor of public policy, **2K5**
(Barry G, Mikael Roman and Arthur N. Dobelis, "Colloquium Article: State Competition as a source driving climate change mitigation" New York University Environmental Law Journal 14 N.Y.U. Envtl. L.J. 1)
See Rabe, supra note 31. At the same time, **some states that appear initially to have very great disincentives to consider any form of climate mitigation have in fact made steps toward mitigation**. **Coal-dependent states** such as Colorado and Pennsylvania, for example, **have enacted RPS policies** in recent years. However, the former came through a ballot proposition. See Rebecca Smith, Voters Force Colorado Utilities to Use Renewable Resources, Wall St. J., Nov. 4, 2004, at A4. And the latter has a number of loopholes that favor burning of so-called "waste-coal" as well as incinerated animal wastes as renewable energy sources. **See Alternative Energy Portfolio Standards Act,** Pa. Cons. State 1648.2 (2005) (**explicitly defining alternative energy sources, such as renewable energy**).

Alternative Energy is whatever is in competition with the conventional fuel

Sterrett, former Judge and member of District of Columbia Bar, **96**
(Samuel B. "Use of industry definitions in interpretation of the internal revenue code" Virginia Tax Review Summer 16Va. Tax Rev.1)
The court's conclusion to ignore the industry definition was reached through the following rather tortuous journey. First, section 44D was **enacted to encourage the development of "alternative energy sources" in the face of competition from "conventional fuels." The primary conventional fuel that** [*27] **constituted the competition was crude oil**. [n110] **Therefore, a qualifying alternative energy source must be something other than crude oil (i.e., a crude oil substitute).** Because high viscosity crude oil that could be produced through "currently used enhanced recovery techniques" was nevertheless crude oil, it could not, by definition, constitute a crude oil substitute and thereby be covered under section 44D of the Code. In crafting the foregoing analytical matrix, the court appears to have been significantly (if not predominantly) influenced by the legislative history of Title I of COWPTA, which adopted an expansive view of "crude oil" (the subject of Title I's excise tax) excluding therefrom only "synthetic petroleum." At the end of its analytical journey, the court essentially defined "oil produced from tar sands" as synthetic petroleum rather than oil (fungible with any other oil) produced from a particular source.

T: Alternative Energy = No use of natural resources

Alternative Energy is obtained from, but does not use up, natural resources
Collins Essential English Dictionary 2K6
(Alternative Energy" http://www.thefreedictionary.com/alternative+energy [accessed 06/26/08])
alternative energy
Noun
a form of energy obtained from natural resources like waves and wind

Noun1.alternative energy - **energy derived from sources that do not use up natural resources or harm the environment**
energy, free energy - (physics) a thermodynamic quantity equivalent to the capacity of a physical system to do work; the units of energy are joules or ergs; "energy can take a wide variety of forms"
solar energy, solar power - energy from the sun that is converted into thermal or electrical energy; "the amount of energy falling on the earth is given by the solar constant, but very little use has been made of solar energy"
wind generation, wind power - power derived from the wind (as by windmills)

T: Alternative Energy = Renewables and not fossil fuels or atomic energy

Alternative Energy is renewable but not atomic energy

New **A**lternatives **F**und, socially responsible mutual fund that emphasizing alternative energy and the environment, **2K4**
("Alternative Energy- Our Definition" http://www.newalternativesfund.com/invest/invest_alternative.html [accessed 06/25/08])

Alternative Energy includes three main groups**:**

- **Renewable Energy (Solar, Wind, Hydro, Geothermal, Biomass)**
- **Fuel Cells & Hydrogen**
- Energy Conservation and Enabling Technologies

Alternative energy
saves natural resources
is environmentally superior to conventional coal and oil.
Wind, flowing water, energy conservation and geothermal heating are ancient but now employ new advanced technology. Technologies such as solar cells, hydrogen and fuel cells and ocean energy are relatively new. All of the technologies operate. The present cost effectiveness of some of the newest technologies varies.

Alternative Energy does not include
Coal
Oil
Atomic energy

Coal and oil are fossil fuels that cause environmental damage when mined and release pollution when combusted.
Alternative energy is cleaner. There may be future technologies for the transformation of coal to a clean source of energy. We do invest in natural gas which is the cleanest of all hydrocarbons, particularly when used in modern turbines and fuel cells. Natural gas is often used to displace dirtier options.

Atomic energy is not included as an area for alternative energy investment – it is unsafe and expensive. There is
significant potential for accident or attack
unresolved radioactive waste disposal problems
frequent community opposition.
cost of dismantling atomic energy facilities as they mature or depreciate - likely to be greater than the original construction cost.
The Fund may invest in conventional energy companies when they are actively developing or producing such items as photovoltaic solar cells, fuel cells or developing other products and technologies related to the Fund areas of interest.

T: RPS must spec the renewables

Defining what renewables are included is the heart of the RPS

Ferrey, Professor of Law Suffolk Univ, **2K4**
(Steven, "Sustainable energy, environmental policy, and states' rights" New York University Environmental Law Journal 12 N.Y.U. Envtl. L.J. 507)

Under PURPA, alternative energy sources are grouped into four categories: biomass, waste, renewable resources, and geothermal resources. [n374] **These federal renewable energy definitions have several practical differences.**

1. Biomass

Traditionally, scientists define biomass as organic plant matter produced by solar energy through photosynthesis, including wood, agricultural wastes, and organic garbage. [n375] FERC interpreted PURPA's definition of **biomass to include "any organic material not derived from fossil fuels**." [n376] FERC includes municipal solid waste, by-product materials from lumber and paper mills, wood chips, peanut shells, almond tree prunings, wheat straw, corn straw, barley, rice straw, and cotton stalks. [n377] In 1982, FERC expanded its definition of biomass to include most of the combustible material in garbage, which is principally derived from biomass. [n378] More specifically, FERC regulations provide that "municipal solid waste conversion (MSW) may be classified as a biomass technology as long as 50 percent of the energy input is organic material not derived from fossil fuels." [n379]

[*575] It should be noted that some forms of waste-fueled generation emit more, not fewer, pollutants than conventional generation. [n380] Congressional tax incentives promoting the use of renewable energy sources limit renewable energy sources to solar, wind, geothermal, and any other "inexhaustible energy supply." [n381] While wood is considered "biomass" under PURPA, a wood burning stove does not qualify as a renewable energy source for purposes of these tax incentives. [n382]

2. Geothermal

Geothermal energy is a second technology with differing federal definitions. **The scientific community describes geothermal energy as heat taken from various underground cavities where the earth's crust has heated water in the form of dry steam** (steam without water droplets), **wet steam** (a mixture of steam and water droplets), **and hot water trapped in fractured or porous rock**. [n383] **Some scientists consider geothermal energy to be both renewable and non-renewable, depending on whether the harvesting rate of a source exceeds its rate of replenishment**. [n384]

Geothermal energy has been the focus of considerable deliberation in the United States Tax Court, principally concerning what temperature the hot water source must be for it to qualify as geothermal energy. [n385] Section 1.23 of the Income Tax Regulations (ITR) defines geothermal deposit as "a geothermal reservoir consisting of natural heat which is from an underground source and is stored in rocks or in an aqueous liquid or vapor (whether or not under pressure), having a temperature exceeding 55 degrees Celsius as measured at the well head." [n386]

PURPA treats geothermal energy as it does biomass and waste energy sources by creating a distinct definition from other renewable resources. [n387] California statutes include geothermal energy in the definitions of renewable resources and renewable [*576] resource devices. [n388] Ironically, the California Appellate Court has found otherwise that geothermal energy is depletable. [n389]3. Hydropower

While **the renewable benefits and detriments of hydroelectric power have raised considerable controversy**, [n390] it is the dominant renewable resource worldwide. **In an executive order issued by** President **Clinton** in 1999, **requiring more federal government use of renewable energy, hydropower was excluded as a renewable resource.** [n391] The federal definition of energy from wind is more consistent. [n392]

[*577] These **definitional variations are more than curiosities. The Clinton administration proposed a 7.5 percent national renewable energy portfolio standard by 2010.** [n393] Democrats were unsuccessful in preventing deletion in conference committee of **a ten percent renewable energy portfolio standard** amendment **to the** late 2003 **Bush energy legislation**, which itself passed the House but fell two votes short of invoking cloture in December 2003. [n394] **These proposals, which would not recognize hydroelectric power as a renewable resource, both contained mandatory net metering of power sales from independent producers to the local utility. How one defines a particular renewable resource at the state or federal levels determines what resources qualify for the state or potential future portfolio requirement**.