

## URNDI '08-09 Topicality

INC: *Violation Skeleton*	2
Definitions: Resolved	3
Definitions: The	3
Definitions: Should	3
Definitions: United States	4
Definitions: Federal Government	4
Definitions: The United States Federal Government	4
INC: Substantially -- Substantial is 'In the Main' 1/1	5
INC: Substantially = Without Material Qualification 1/1	6
Definitions: Substantially	7
Definitions: Increase	9
INC: Increase -- Increase is to Make Greater	10
2NC: Increase -- Increase is to Make Greater	10
INC: Increase -- Increase is to Create New	11
2NC: Increase -- Increase is to Create New	11
INC: No "Its" means Fed. Govt. Incentives on Itself are NOT topical	12
INC Violation: Nuclear is NOT Topical 1/1	13
2NC Topicality Neg Extn...Nuclear is NOT Alternative Energy 1/2	14
2NC Topicality Neg Extn...Nuclear is NOT Alternative Energy 2/2	15
2NC Definition Extns: Nuclear is Not Alternative Energy	16
Definition: Alternative Energy -- is Broad, Means Non-Traditional	18
T: An Increase in Fossil Fuel Efficiency is NOT Alternative Energy	19
Efficiency Affs are NOT Topical	19
Definition: Alternative Energy -- is Divided into Two Categories, Renewables and Non-Renewables	20
Definition: Alternative Energy -- 6 Main Types	21
Definition: Alternative Energy -- is Distinct from Hydrogen Fuel	22
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Alternative Oil or Gas	22
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Not Be Green Building or Emissions Credits	22
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Batteries/Development Of	23
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Solar	23
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Wind	23
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Geothermal	24
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Hydro/Tidal/Wave	24
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Renewable	24
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Biomass	25
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Biofuel	25
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Oil Sand/Shale Oil	26
Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Natural Gas	26
Definition: Alternative Energy Incentives -- (Categories)	27
Definition: Alternative Energy Incentives -- is Tax Incentives	28
INC: Incentives -- Must Be To Undetermined Third Party	29
INC: Incentives -- No Worse Off Test (Pressure is not T) 1/2	30
INC: Incentives -- No Worse Off Test (Pressure is not T) 2/2	31
Definition: Incentives	32
Definitions: In	32
T: Repealing Fossil Fuel Subsidies = Extra Topical action	33
Topicality: Government Grants for Research are NOT Incentives	33
Definition: Incentives -- Are Not Coercive	34
Definition: Incentives -- Must Highlight Desired Action, Not Target Undesired	34
INC: In the United States -- is Specifically Within	35
INC: In the United States -- is "Throughout" the United States	36
Topicality: Limits Good on This Topic / Extra Topicality Extn	37
2NC: Topicality is a Voting Issue	38
2NC Extra-Topicality is a Voting Issue	39
2NC Effects-Topicality is a Voting Issue	39
2AC AT: Extra Topicality (it is Not a Voter)	40
2AC AT: Effects Topicality (It is Not a Voter)	41
INC: Should -- Is the Past Tense of Shall	42
2NC: Should -- Is the Past Tense of Shall	42
INC: Should -- Is the Future Obligation	43
2NC: Should -- Is the Future Obligation	43
2AC AT: 'Should is the Past Tense of Shall'	44
INC: A-Spec	45
2NC: A-Spec	45
INC: O-Spec	46
2NC: O-Spec	46



## 1NC: \*Violation Skeleton\*

### A. Interpretation:

Lay out your view of the resolution, typically focused on a few words in the context of the whole topic. Even though you want to offer some definitions here, this is not just about the definitions, but also about starting the explanation of the negative's interpretation. What do you think the topic should look like and how is that a fair way to view it? Definitions can come from a variety of sources—legal definitions, dictionaries, articles, experts in the field, or even your own words.

### B. Violation:

Here is why the aff is not topical—does not meet the interpretation—is outside the topic. The plan violates the interpretation because.... Take this opportunity to continue the development of the interpretation. It also helps to give two or three separate reasons why the plan is non-topical. (1, 2, 3). If you do that, make sure each number is distinct and well-explained.

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Ground** – Continue to defend the interpretation by talking about the ground it provides—what affs are topical and why is that predictable? A list of cases or types of cases that are topical can help.
2. **Limits** – They unlimit because they are so far outside the topic that hundreds if not thousands of cases become topical. It always helps here to argue that there is a topical version of their case within a more limited view of the resolution. (See the “limits necessary” block down below).
3. **Education** – **What does education mean (briefly) and how does your interpretation enhance the type of education and its relation to the topic.**

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations. The plan text on face must be topical and this is a gateway issue that precedes any assessment of the content of the plan.**



## Definitions: Resolved

**Resolved means a firm course of action.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2000**

v. tr. To make a firm decision about.

**Resolved means determined.**

**Word Net, 2003**

resolved: adj 1: determined: "she was firmly resolved to be a doctor"; "single-minded in his determination to stop smoking" [syn: single-minded] 2: explained or answered; "mysteries solved and unsolved; problems resolved and unresolved" [syn: solved] [ant: unsolved]

## Definitions: The

**'The' is a mass noun.**

**American Heritage Dictionary 2000**

Used before a singular noun indicating that the noun is

generic: The wolf is an endangered species.

**'The' is a specifier.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

def.art. Used before singular or plural nouns and noun phrases that denote particular, specified persons or things

**'The' specifies a group.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

Used before a noun, and generally stressed, to emphasize one of a group or type as the most outstanding or prominent: considered Lake Shore Drive to be the neighborhood to live in these days.

**'The' means uniquely.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

Used to indicate uniqueness

**'The' means per or for each of the however many of the plural noun.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

Used before a noun with the force of per: cherries at \$1.50 the box.

**'The' refers to a group of objects.**

**Kernerman English Multilingual Dictionary, 2006.**

adj. used with a singular noun or an adjective to refer to all members of a group etc or to a general type of object, group of objects etc

**'The' refers to unique objects.**

**Kernerman English Multilingual Dictionary, 2006.**

adj. used to refer to unique objects etc, especially in titles and names

## Definitions: Should

**Should implies an obligation for future or present actions.**

**Merriam Webster's Dictionary, 2004**

Should – used in an auxiliary function to express obligation, propriety, or expediency <'tis commanded I should do so – Shakespeare><this is as it should be – H.L. Savage><you should brush your teeth after every meal>

**Should means future action.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2000**

should

aux.v. Past tense of shall

Used to express obligation or duty: You should send her a note.]

**Should means obligation.**

**Oxford English Dictionary, 1989**

Should 1 used to indicate obligation, duty, or correctness, typically when criticizing someone's actions

**Should implies duty and obligation.**

**Words and Phrases, 1986**

The word "should," as used in instructions, may convey to the jury the sense of duty and obligation. State v. Connor, 87 P. 703, 74 Kan. 898.



## Definitions: United States

**United States means the United States of America.**

### **American Heritage Dictionary, 2000**

United States or United States of America Abbr. U.S. or US or U.S.A. or USA A country of central and northwest North America with coastlines on the Atlantic and Pacific oceans. It includes the noncontiguous states of Alaska and Hawaii and various island territories in the Caribbean Sea and Pacific Ocean. The area now occupied by the contiguous 48 states was originally inhabited by numerous Native American peoples and was colonized beginning in the 16th century by Spain, France, the Netherlands, and England. Great Britain eventually controlled most of the Atlantic coast and, after the French and Indian Wars (1754-1763), the Northwest Territory and Canada. The original Thirteen Colonies declared their independence from Great Britain in 1776 and formed a government under the Articles of Confederation in 1781, adopting (1787) a new constitution that went into effect after 1789. The nation soon began to expand westward. Growing tensions over the issue of Black slavery divided the country along geographic lines, sparking the secession of the South and the Civil War (1861-1865). The remainder of the 19th century was marked by increased westward expansion, industrialization, and the influx of millions of immigrants. The United States entered World War II after the Japanese attack (1941) on Pearl Harbor and emerged after the war as a world power. Washington, D.C., is the capital and New York the largest city. Population: 260,651,000.

## Definitions: Federal Government

**Federal means the political unit created by the states, not the states themselves.**

### **Oxford English Dictionary, 1989**

2ed. XIX, p. 795

b. Of or pertaining to the political unity so constituted, as distinguished from the separate states composing it.

**Federal Government means all three branches.**

### **Blacks Law Dictionary, 1990 p. 695**

In the United States, government consists of the executive, legislative, and judicial branches in addition to administrative agencies. In a broader sense, includes the federal government and all its agencies and bureaus, state and county governments, and city and township governments.

**Government means a governing political body.**

### **American Heritage Dictionary, 2000**

gov-ern-ment n. The act or process of governing, especially the control and administration of public policy in a political unit. The office, function, or authority of a governing individual or body.

**Government is the governance of a political unit.**

### **Word Net, 2003 government**

n 1: the organization that is the governing authority of a political unit; "the government reduced taxes"; "the matter was referred to higher authorities" [syn: authorities, regime] 2: (government) the system or form by which a community or other political unit is governed; "tyrannical government" 3: the act of governing; exercising authority; "regulations for the governing of state prisons"; "he had considerable experience of government" [syn: governing, governance, government activity] 4: the study of government of states and other political units [syn: politics, political science]

## Definitions: The United States Federal Government

**United States Federal Government is the executive, legislative and judicial branch governing over the 50 states in North America.**

### **Word Net, 2003**

United States n 1: North American republic containing 50 states - 48 conterminous states in North America plus Alaska in northwest North America and the Hawaiian Islands in the Pacific Ocean; achieved independence in 1776 [syn: United States, United States of America, America, US, U.S., USA, U.S.A.] 2: the executive and legislative and judicial branches of the federal government of the United States [syn: United States government, United States, U.S. government, US Government, U.S.]



## 1NC: Substantially -- Substantial is 'In the Main' 1/1

**A. Interpretation: The plan text on face must increase an already existing program of alternative energy incentives “in the main.”**

### 1. Substantial means “in the main”

Ballantine’s Law Dictionary (3rd edition, 1969, p. 1232)  
substantially. In the main. Essentially.

What exactly, does this mean? The best way to determine if the plan text is “in the main” is to make sure it covers the essential components of current AEIs.

### 2. Increase means “to add to.”

#### **Webster’s Dictionary 1998**

Increase: to make greater, augment, implies to what is already well grown, or well developed

### 3. Alternative energy incentives take on three main forms: building, electricity, and financial incentives.

**US Dept. of Energy, 2008.** [February 8, “State Energy Alternatives,” p. 0/1: [http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax\\_incentives.cfm](http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax_incentives.cfm).]

This section contains objective information about public policies that may facilitate the use of alternative energy technologies. Each policy is briefly described. After each description, the likely advantages and disadvantages of the policy are laid out as "Arguments For" and "Arguments Against." The lists of arguments are not exhaustive, nor do they represent the views of the U.S. Department of Energy or the National Renewable Energy Laboratory. They are intended solely to be illustrative of varying perspectives. Endorsement of these viewpoints is not intended and should not be inferred. Policy descriptions are organized as follows: buildings, electricity, and financial incentives. For information about current state policies related to energy efficiency, see the Alliance to Save Energy's State Energy Efficiency Index. The National Renewable Energy Laboratory's Energy Analysis Office has developed various models and tools that can assist in learning more about energy efficiency and renewable energy technologies and their uses. Most of these tools can be applied on a global, regional, local, or project basis. The Alternative Fuels Data Center sponsored by the U.S. Department of Energy's Clean Cities and Energy Policy Act of 1992 (EPA Act) fleet programs, provides a listing of state and federal incentives and policies related to alternative fuels.

**B. Violation: The affirmative does not substantially increase incentives for the main types of alternative energies: building, electricity, or financial incentives.** They do not give meaning to “substantially increase” because any increase within any small sub-set of incentives would be topical.

### C. Reasons to prefer:

1. **Their interpretation moots substantially and increase from the resolution** – this reduces predictability, since we based our prep on the resolution and they can make link arguments on “incentives.”
2. **Moots counterplan & disad ground** – we should be able to at least minor repair with less than substantial increases.
3. **Literature** – Their plan is not in the literature as a substantial increase – our contextual evidence delineates what is “in the main” – the resolution is not necessary or sufficient.
4. **Explodes the topic** – If they do not have to be a substantial increase in the incentives for the main forms of alternative energy, then any change in US energy policy is topical – which had no unique, predictable negative ground.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**



## 1NC: Substantially = Without Material Qualification 1/1

### A. Interpretation:

#### 1. Substantially means “without material qualification.”

**Blacks Law Dictionary, 1990.**

#### 2. There are 6 main types of alternative energy—meaning that the plan cannot distinguish one over the other—the plan must cover all 6 without material qualification.

**Cnn.com, 2006.** [Principle Voices is a non-profit that is stimulating discussion on the major challenges facing the world today. In 2008 we will be discussing the Economics of Energy, Design for Good and Climate Change, "Are Sun and Wind the Energy Answers?" p. o/l: <http://www.principalvoices.com/2006/environment/alternative.energy.html>]

The most common 'alternative' energy source, hydro-electric power, amounts for just 2.15% of total global primary energy supply, according to data from the International Energy Agency. Wind power makes up 0.05% and solar less than 0.04%. Growth in renewable sources, especially for anything other than electricity generation, remains slow, requiring major global efforts for them to have a meaningful impact. Some **proponents of alternative energies argue that technology is not the issue, given that most of the methods have been around for decades. Instead, they say, it is simply the political will that us lacking. The main forms of alternative energy are: Hydro-electric power:** The longest-established alternative source - water wheels have been used for hundreds of years - hydro power accounts for almost a fifth of all electricity generated worldwide. Harnessing the energy contained in water flowing to a lower elevation, it is highly efficient but limited by the necessity of suitable natural sites. For example, mountainous Kyrgyzstan in Central Asia produces 90 percent of all its electricity by hydropower - not an option in, say, the Netherlands. **Solar:** Sunlight contains many thousand times more energy than humans use but harnessing it can be expensive. The most common method, photovoltaic cells, which turn light directly in electricity, work at a maximum efficiency of little more than 15 percent and are also expensive to buy. The few existing commercial solar power stations are huge - the biggest, in Southern California's Mojave Desert, covers 1,000 acres. An even bigger facility is being built nearby. Edison International's project uses mirrors to reflect heat onto Stirling engines, a near-200 year old design in which sunlight heats hydrogen, which in turn moves pistons to generate power. When completed the site will generate enough power for almost 280,000 homes. **Wind:** The sight of massive wind turbines gently whirring atop a cliff or hill is increasingly common, particularly in parts of northern Europe, such as Germany and Denmark. However, such 'wind farms' have prompted a bitter divide among environmentalists, with some green campaigners arguing long ranks of turbines scar the countryside, can make noise and kill too many birds and bats with their blades. One alternative is to site wind farms offshore, but this makes them more expensive to maintain - not to mention a potential shipping hazard. **Wave and tidal power:** Thus far a negligible contributor, with only a few mainly experimental sites worldwide. The most common prototypes use the kinetic energy of ebbing and flowing tides by trapping water in barrages, which then powers turbines. **Nuclear:** Even mentioning nuclear power in the same breath as renewable energies is sacrilege to many environmentalists. But proponents argue that modern reactors are safer and more efficient than those used in the past, as well as being powerful enough to have a real impact on fossil fuel use. **[Alternative] Fossil fuels:** Still more controversially, Professor Mark Jaccard at Vancouver's Simon Fraser University, insists oil, coal and gas are still the way forward. He argues that there are enough resources to last at least another 500 years and that burning fossil fuels more cleanly - for example 'capturing' carbon dioxide emissions underground - is the most feasible way of saving the environment

### **B. Violation: the affirmative materially qualifies their plan - they specify a particular type of alternative energy, only increasing a sub-set of overall alternative energy incentives.**

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Limits** – There are thousands of forms of alternative energy—they have provided such specific detail that they are no longer a substantial increase.
2. **Ground** – They get out of generic alternative energy incentives links and even allow anti-topical action by potentially trading off with other forms of US incentive programs.
3. **“Substantially” must have meaning because anything is simply an “increase.”** Absent a meaningful counter-interpretation, “without material qualification” means the aff. cannot make particular qualifications on the incentives beyond what the US broadly offers now.
4. **Pre-empt** – They can still “direct” their incentives to broad areas, they just should not be allowed to make qualifications within a type of alternative energy.

### D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity.



## Definitions: Substantially

### **Substantially means at least 95%.**

**Lavelle, JD** from DePaul University, **1989** [Kerry M., Virginia Tax Review, Lexis]

[The origin of section 482 can be traced to Articles 77 and 78 of Regulation 41 of the Revenue Act of 1921 ("1921 Act") which imposed the requirement that "affiliated" domestic corporations and partnerships file consolidated returns. <sup>9</sup> That Regulation was ratified by section 1331 of the 1921 Act, <sup>10</sup> but was narrowly construed to apply only to entities that bought and sold products among each other either above or below the current market price, in effect creating an artificial distribution of profit. The "affiliation" required in the early 1920's between the two businesses that traded goods was either direct ownership or control of substantially all of the stock of the two business entities. While this statute did not define the term "substantially all," Treasury Decision 2662 (March, 1918) clarified section 78 of Regulation 41, stating that "substantially all of the stock" meant ninety-five percent. Subsequently, section 1331 of the 1921 Act accepted this definition of the term "substantially." ]

### **Substantially means more than 50%.**

**Dupre**, Associate Professor of Law at the University of Georgia Law, **2000**  
[Anne, Washington Law Review, Jan, Lexis]

[In fact, the statute defines "substantial" evidence as "beyond a mere preponderance," or beyond fifty percent. <sup>311</sup> Given that definition of "substantial evidence," it would appear that "substantially likely" means that the school must show that there is a more than fifty-percent likelihood that injury will occur before a violent student can be placed in an alternative setting.]

### **Substantially means at least 30%.**

**Ferraro**, Partner at Clifford Chance Rogers & Wells, **2002** [Joseph, American University Law Review, April, Lexis]

[The Federal Circuit noted that, in this case, the specification defines "substantially increased" as an increase of at least thirty percent and provides reasonable guidance through the examples of how the increase should be measured. <sup>534</sup> The court also observed that the specification discloses suggestions for how long a "period sufficient" might be, and the parties agreed that a "period sufficient" could be determined by doing activity checks. <sup>535</sup> The Federal Circuit noted that, "when a word of degree is used the district court must [<sup>\*691</sup>] determine whether the patent's specification provides some standard for measuring that degree." <sup>536</sup> In this case, the specification provided guidance as to what was meant by "substantial absence" with a reasonable degree of particularity and definiteness. <sup>537</sup> Accordingly, the Federal Circuit reversed the summary judgment of invalidity and remanded the case to the Court of Federal Claims. <sup>538</sup>]

### **Substantially means 'to a great degree.'**

#### **Word Net 2003**

##### substantially

adv 1: to a great extent or degree; "I'm afraid the film was well over budget"; "painting the room white made it seem considerably (or substantially) larger"; "the house has fallen considerably in value"; "the price went up substantially" [syn: well, considerably] 2: in a strong substantial way; "the house was substantially built"]

#### **Substantial means "in the main."**

**Ballantine's Law Dictionary** (3rd edition, **1969**, p. 1232)

SUBSTANTIALLY. In the main. Essentially.

### **Substantially means more than 50%.**

**Dupre**, Associate Professor of Law at the University of Georgia Law, **2000** [Anne, Washington Law Review, Jan, Lexis]

In fact, the statute defines "substantial" evidence as "beyond a mere preponderance," or beyond fifty percent. <sup>311</sup> Given that definition of "substantial evidence," it would appear that "substantially likely" means that the school must show that there is a more than fifty-percent likelihood that injury will occur before a violent student can be placed in an alternative setting.



## Definitions: Substantially

**Substantially is to a large degree.**

**Cambridge International Dictionary 2004**

[Online, Dictionary.Cambridge.org]

[substantially adverb

The new rules will substantially (= to a large degree) change how we do things]

**Substantially means ‘in substance.’**

**Oxford English Dictionary 1989**

[2ed. XIX, p. 68]

[Substantially – 1. In substance; in one’s or its substantial nature or existence; as a substantial thing or being.]

**Substantially is not the same as essentially.**

**Words and Phrases 1964**

[Permanent edition, volume 40, p. 819]

[The word “substantially” is not necessarily synonymous with “essentially.”]

**Substantially is to a great extent.**

**Compact Oxford English Dictionary 2005**

[http://www.askoxford.com/concise\\_oed/substantially?view=uk](http://www.askoxford.com/concise_oed/substantially?view=uk)

[substantially

adverb 1 to a great or significant extent]

**Substantially is without qualification.**

**Black’s Law Dictionary 1990**

[Substantially: without material qualification.]

Words & Phrases 64 (vol 40 p.818)

“Substantially” means meeting requirements in essential and material parts.

The word “substantially”...is used “as often as it is, in the sense of comprehending the form given; all that is necessary or essential.”

Ballentine’s Law in 69 (3rd ed. p.1232)

substantially. In the main; essentially.

Words & Phrases in 64 (p.516)

“Substantially” in phrase “drying to remove substantially all moisture” means so nearly dry as to behave as if entirely dry.

Words & Phrases in 64 (p.759)

“Substantial” is a relative term, the meaning of which is to be gauged by all the circumstances surrounding the transaction, in reference to which the expression has been used. It imports a considerable amount or value in opposition to that which is inconsequential or small.

*Words & Phrases*, 64, 818.

“‘Substantially’ means in substance; in the main; essentially; by including the material or essential part. *Town of Checotah v. Town of Eufaula*, 119 P. 1014, 1019, 31 Okl. 85; *Vannest v. Murphy*, 112 N.W. 236, 238, 135 Iowa, 123. See, also, *Electric Candy Mach. Co. v. Morris*, 156 F. 972, 974; *Elsfeld v. Kenworth*, 50 Iowa, 389, 390.”

*Words & Phrases*, 64, 818.

“The word ‘substantially,’ in Code, § 1246, subd. 7, providing that certificates of the examination of married women should be substantially according to a form prescribed in the statute, is used ‘as it often is, in the sense of comprehending the form given; all that is necessary or essential.’ *Lineberger v. Tidwell*, 10 S.E. 758, 761, 104 N.C. 506.”





## Definitions: Increase

**Increase means to become greater.**

**American Heritage Dictionary 2000**

<http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/increase>

To become greater or larger. To multiply; reproduce.

**Increase means to multiply.**

**Webster's Dictionary 1996**

To multiply by the production of young; to be fertile, fruitful, or prolific

**Increase means net increase.**

**Words and Phrases Vol 20 A 2004**

La.App.2 Cir. 1972 Within insurance company's superintendent's employment contract, "increase" meant net increase in premiums generated by agent calculated by subtracting "lapses" or premiums lost on policies previously issued from gross premiums added by new policies sold and "one time" meant payment made as salary or bonus to agent on dollar for dollar or "one for one" basis measured by net increase. – Lanier v Trans-World Life Ins. Co. 258 So.2d 103 – Insurance 1652(1)

**Increase means "to become greater or larger"**

**Wordnet, 2003.** (2.0 edition, Downloaded at Dictionary.com, Downloaded: 3-19-06)

a process of becoming larger or longer or more numerous or more important; "the increase in unemployment"; "the growth of population" [syn: increment, growth] [ant: decrease]



## 1NC: Increase -- Increase is to Make Greater

### A. Interpretation:

**The affirmative must increase an already existing program of alternative energy incentives.**

**Webster's Dictionary 1998**

Increase: to make greater, augment, implies to what is already well grown, or well developed

**B. Violation: The affirmative implements a new form of alternative energy incentives and doesn't augment one that already exists.**

---

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Limits** – Our interpretation limits out the millions of cases that the affirmative can pull out of thin air which haven't existed yet. This allows for utopian affirmative's that would be really nice if the United States Federal Government actually implemented them. This destroys a negative's ability to compete.
2. **Ground** – We provide a predictable literature base from which to garner disad and critique links as well as solvency arguments.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**

---

## 2NC: Increase -- Increase is to Make Greater

**Our Webster's Dictionary 1998 evidence indicates that increase means to augment an already existing program of alternative energy incentives. The affirmative fails to do this, which is bad for a few reasons:**

1. **Limits** – our interpretation limits out the million of possible forms of new alternative energy the affirmative could have the USFG incentivize. – there are an infinite amount of interpretations of what qualifies as an 'incentive' making the number of potential affirmatives explosive, unfairly shifting the research burden of the negative and unlimiting the topic.
2. **Ground** – all the best links are tied to existing programs because that is what the literature assumes. they kill critical disad, counterplan, and kritik ground by not choosing a current incentive to increase. How do we get a link to something so small or something that doesn't exist yet?
3. **Predictable Education** – allowing the affirmative to use incentives other than those currently proposed by the USFG moots educational debates on policy options available in the status quo in favor of virtually any incentive they could think up.



## 1NC: Increase -- Increase is to Create New

### A. Interpretation:

Increase means to create a new policy.

**B. Violation: the affirmative fails to create a new policy of alternative energy incentives; they augment an existing one.**

---

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

4. **Ground** – by adding to an already existing policy, the affirmative can non-unique all of the disad links and solvency turns by simply arguing that plan has already been passed in some form or another.
5. **Education** – the reason we have a topic is that there is a controversy or problem not being addressed adequately in the status quo. Therefore, creating new solutions to status quo problems can we adequately address the harms presented in the topic. This implicates the affirmative's ability to solve and topic specific education. Otherwise, we just learn about the status quo and current events.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**

---

## 2NC: Increase -- Increase is to Create New

**Our interpretation of the topic is that affirmative's must create a new policy of alternative energy incentives. This is the best interpretation for debate for a few reasons:**

1. **Ground** – not creating a new policy affords affirmatives the opportunity to non-unique our disad links and solvency turns because the plan has been passed in some form or another.
2. **Limit** – their interpretation functionally moots inherency from an affirmative's inherent barrier. We debate a topic because a controversy isn't adequately being addressed in the status quo. Only our interpretation increases topic specific education.

**Topicality is a voting issue for the reasons above and competitive equity because the way the affirmative has written their plan text has already unduly balanced the debate in their favor.**



## 1NC: No “Its” means Fed. Govt. Incentives on Itself are NOT topical

**A. Interpretation: The topic does not say “its incentives,” meaning that the incentives need to be for a different agent.**

**1. Its’ is the possessive form – refers to the United States’ alternative energy policy.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2000**

Usage Note: Its is the possessive form of the pronoun it and is correctly written without an apostrophe. It should not be confused with the contraction it's (for it is or it has), which should always have an apostrophe.

**2. Federal is the central government—the incentives being increased by the affirmative belong to the central government.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 1992**

federal -3. Of or relating to the central government of a federation as distinct from the government of its member units.

**B. Violation: They increase alternative energy incentives that belong to the United States federal government and not another agent. This goes beyond the scope of the resolution since "its" is not in the resolution, nor is there a possessive pronoun correlation between the USFG and incentives.**

**C. Reasons to Prefer:**

1. They allow federal incentives on itself. This confuses solvency with topicality AND destroys the notion of object fiat. Object fiat is ground that should be written out of the resolution because it allows the plan text to substitute for solvency and it allows fiat to stand in for affirmative solvency advocates. The resolution implies “external recipients” for the incentives—this is a fair topic and excludes the aff.
2. **Extra-Topicality** – The affirmative gets to claim advantages on increases the United States federal government. This limits ground for the negative since there are only a minutia of policies that the USFG currently implements regarding alternative energy.
3. **Ground** – they destroy any negative disad and counterplan ground based on alternate agents of action, including all trade-off or focus arguments.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**



## 1NC Violation: Nuclear is NOT Topical 1/1

A. Alternative Energy is defined primarily as renewable sources of power. Nuclear is Not Alternative Energy even in a broad conception.

Charles **Digges, '08**. [Jan. 10<sup>th</sup>, Bellona Fellow, "Position Paper: Nuclear Energy Not an Alternative," p. o/l:  
[http://www.bellona.org/position\\_papers/nonuke\\_bellonaposition](http://www.bellona.org/position_papers/nonuke_bellonaposition)]

While numerous methods of alternative energy production are being considered on an international level – like industrial retrofitting to capture and sequester harmful carbon, producing hybrid cars, developing hydrogen fuel cells for transport, and re-visiting solar, wind, and biomass energies – a preponderance of wealthy nations have also advanced ambitious plans to expand nuclear energy. On Thursday, the government of the United Kingdom delivered the findings of its nuclear consultation to a largely receptive parliament, backing wide scale construction of new nuclear power plants in that country to both meet forecasted energy demands and cut its CO2 emissions as part of the fight against global climate change. Other EU nations, which stand to profit by building reactors for Britain, have been watching the reaction to the decision closely, and many EU countries, diplomats say, plan to follow the nuclear example.

Bellona is fundamentally opposed to advancing the cause of nuclear energy as a method for reducing greenhouse gasses, and urges nations to invest in ultimately cheaper and more durable forms of clean energy. When long term damage to the environment from the nuclear fuel cycle, the heightened risk of nuclear proliferation in aggressive regimes, and the simple fact that there is no safe way to store nuclear waste are taken into account, the short term benefits of a reliance on nuclear power are diminished by the even graver pollution and security concerns it produces.

B. Violation---The plan provides incentives for nuclear power—or at least is extra topical--by funding nuclear energy.

C. Standards: We provide ground—the best limits would exclude nuclear energy as topical.

Russell **Hasan, '08**. [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l:  
<http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>]

There is already growing concern among businessmen and government officials over diminishing oil supplies. With the majority of traditional world oil reserves in the politically unstable Middle East, and the vulnerability of American oil pipelines revealed by Hurricanes Katrina and Rita, there is a growing recognition that America needs to develop alternative energy supplies. Solar power, wind power, hydroelectric power, geothermal power, tidal power, biomass, biofuels such as ethanol and biodiesel, and hydrogen fuel cells have the potential to help the American energy industry and to ameliorate American dependence upon foreign oil. Nontraditional oil and gas exploration will provide the rest of the energy needed to satisfy the American and global hunger for energy.

Also. Don't buy their evidence---they will define "alternative energy" very loosely, almost an "option"—making any energy policy topical. A typical card from the 2AC demonstrates the way they explode the topic. It's about limits on a massive topic, especially if incentives are broad.

**Global Ed, '07** [ An Experimental Web-Based Study, Fall, "Global Environment, Alternatives," p. o/l:  
[http://www.globaled.uconn.edu/Fall\\_2007/GE\\_scenario\\_f.htm](http://www.globaled.uconn.edu/Fall_2007/GE_scenario_f.htm)]

The Benefits of Nuclear Energy: Nuclear energy is a clean alternative to fossil fuels. Nuclear power plants do not pollute the air with emissions like carbon dioxide, sulfur dioxide or nitrogen oxides **as do other energy alternatives, namely coal, gas and oil.**



## 2NC Topicality Neg Extn....Nuclear is NOT Alternative Energy 1/2

----Our interpretation is superior, they are defining Alternative Energy and then looking at incentives. We have to look at INCENTIVES first and then assess “alternative energy incentives.”

---( ). This EXCLUDES Nuclear for two reasons: uranium supplies are being depleted, and nuclear is not a viable solution.

( ). Alternative energy sources fill the gap between unrealistic sources and current fossil fuels. This means new fossil fuels or renewables. TWO BIG AREAS....

----the first is “alternative oil and gas exploration”

----the second is also energy that reduces dependence on foreign sources, namely: Solar power, wind power, hydroelectric power, geothermal power, tidal power, biomass, biofuels such as ethanol and biodiesel, and hydrogen fuel cells

Russell **Hasan, '08**. [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, “Introduction to Alternative Energy,” p. o/l:  
<http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

One of the primary reasons that alternative energy is so attractive is that conventional fossil fuel supplies are running out. The evidence for this is presented in the case for the “Peak Oil” theory that has been endorsed by many experts. As oil, coal and natural gas supplies become scarce there is going to be a shortage of energy resources. Uranium supplies are also being depleted and are becoming expensive to develop, and nuclear is too unsafe to provide a complete solution. Alternative energy sources stand poised to fill this gap. As global fossil fuel reserves become depleted, industries will be forced to convert to new energy supplies in order to remain competitive. There is an important opportunity for alternative oil and gas exploration to provide the necessary oil and gas resources to last us until renewable energy infrastructure can be created to satisfy world energy demand.

( ). If “nuclear power” is not viable, particularly for transportation, than it is not energy in the first place...it’s like cold fusion or space matter, or the tesla coil, or the orgone accumulator....or nano-technology.

( ). Shifting from fossil fuels does not prove topicality. Nuclear represents a shift, but it’s not alternative energy—there is a distinction.

**Solomon & Freedberg, Profs Law @ GW, 90** (20 Env’tl. L. 83, “The Greenhouse...”)

The shift from our present patterns of fossil fuel consumption may lead to a greater reliance on nuclear energy. However, the use of safer, more decentralized solar, wind, and hydropower energy sources may become viable and economical alternatives.



## 2NC Topicality Neg Extn....Nuclear is NOT Alternative Energy 2/2

( ). Nuclear is distinct from alternative energy. It is not a clean source in the same way and a clear line can be drawn.

Charles **Digges, '08**. [Jan. 10<sup>th</sup>, Bellona Fellow, "Position Paper: Nuclear Energy Not an Alternative," p. o/l:  
[http://www.bellona.org/position\\_papers/nonuke\\_bellonaposition](http://www.bellona.org/position_papers/nonuke_bellonaposition)]

Risks from nuclear power, further, do not fit well into classical quantitative risk assessment models, making insuring against the results of a disaster hard to calculate. When governments agree to underwrite disasters – like Great Britain did on Thursday - it makes nuclear investment more attractive, but also potentially catastrophic in financial and well as human terms should and accident occur, as the burden falls to the taxpayer to pay for industry's disaster.

Money ill spent on nuclear energy better spent on alternatives

It is clear that nuclear merchants have the money and the technical know-how to divert the incredible resources they are willing to spend on nuclear power development into developing clean alternative energy that leaves no environmental footprint at all. Even the White House – whose electrical current is supplied by solar power – recognises this, even if the administration that inhabits it does not. Bellona therefore urges the merchants of nuclear power, and the governments and corporate interests that back them, to reconsider their planned investments in the nuclear renaissance, and spend that money on developing truly clean, renewable energy sources that have neither to be paid for by the health of future generations nor the security of the worlds citizens. Given that it will be possible to address climate change without relying on nuclear power, trading a large hard-to-predict, potentially catastrophic consequences of climate change for other large, hard-to-predict potentially catastrophic consequences of a large-scale expansion of nuclear power, Bellona does not see the sense in pursuing the nuclear grail.

( ). Nuclear power falls into the fossil fuel category—like coal, which we may have some supply of, uranium is also dwindling and pollutes. We still allow ground for non-nuclear alternative energy incentives.

Russell **Hasan, '08**. [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l:  
<http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Simultaneously with household use, alternative energy is going to become popular with corporations and businesses. The price of oil is continually rising and global supplies of light sweet crude oil are running out. Also, oil production is controlled by a cartel of countries who drive the price up and make oil overpriced in American markets. This is going to make oil an unattractive option for industrial purposes in the future. The prospects for coal, natural gas and nuclear are also bad, due to both financial and environmental reasons. Global supplies of coal, natural gas and uranium are becoming depleted, and these energy sources produce pollution on a scale that is undesirable. These factors are going to lead businesses and corporations to turn to alternative energy sources for their electricity. There are many cases of businesses using green building to reduce energy costs and relying on renewable energy to have a reliable and cost-effective source of power. As alternative energy supplies become economically feasible they will be adopted by conventional businesses, to the point of becoming mainstream in the future, and the companies that supply alternative energy stand to make substantial profits by supplying energy to these companies.



## 2NC Definition Extns: Nuclear is Not Alternative Energy

**Alternative energy excludes nuclear power.**

**Title 26 of the U.S. Code, 2008.** [Cornell LII, Legal Information Institute, "U.S. Code Collection," p. o/l:  
[http://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/26/usc\\_sec\\_26\\_00007701----000-.html](http://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/26/usc_sec_26_00007701----000-.html).]

Alternative energy facility

For purposes of subparagraph (A), the term "alternative energy facility" means a facility for producing electrical or thermal energy if the primary energy source for the facility is not oil, natural gas, coal, or nuclear power.

**Nuclear power is a traditional form of energy, not an alternative form.**

Russell **Hasan, '08.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l:  
<http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

We now stand at an important historical crossroads in terms of the structure of both American and global society. The focal point of our changing world is our growing dependence upon foreign oil and our rapidly diminishing traditional sources of energy such as oil, natural gas, coal and nuclear power. Americans are addicted to oil and other forms of energy and our need for energy grows exponentially as American industry grows. There is especially a depletion of usable light sweet crude oil. The simple fact, which every authority agrees upon, is that our need for energy is soon going to outpace our ability to draw energy from traditional resources.

**Alternative energy excludes nuclear energy -- it's too dangerous.**

Russell **Hasan, '08.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l:  
<http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

The global supply of coal, natural gas, and most importantly oil are becoming depleted, nuclear power is too dangerous, and without alternative energy sources we will experience a severe lack of energy in the future. Therefore it is necessary for us to discover alternative energy sources in order for our industrial and commercial future in the twenty-first century to be secure.

**Alternative energy excludes nuclear energy -- it damages the environment like the rest.**

Russell **Hasan, '08.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l:  
<http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Another reason for the need for alternative energy sources to be developed is the increasingly devastated state of our environment. The use of nuclear power, oil, gas and coal all produce a great deal of waste product which pollutes the environment. Oil, natural gas and coal produce toxic smoke which pollutes the air and affects global warming, while nuclear produces radioactive waste and can give rise to environmental disasters such as the Chernobyl and Three Mile Island accidents. For these reasons it is going to be necessary to shift to alternative energy sources in the future in order to maintain a sustainable ecosystem.





## Aff Alternative Energy Args (General) -- Means Anything Non-Traditional

1. We meet—the plan is an incentive for the energy they specify.
2. The phrase is about INCENTIVES as the focus, NOT alternative energy. They have to define the phrase or show how their definition is specific to incentives and not supplies or sources.
3. They have ground—the case debate and link debate is available for them—the plan is not an obscure form of energy.
4. Alternative energy should just be anything not traditional—which we meet.

**Alternative energy is any kind of energy other than fossil fuels of oil, natural gas, and coal.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. 0/1: <http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

An overview of the various kinds of alternative energy follows. At the outset we must differentiate between alternative energy, and renewable energy. Alternative energy refers to any form of energy which is an alternative to the traditional fossil fuels of oil, natural gas and coal. Renewable energy are the forms of alternative energy that are renewed by the natural processes of the Earth, such as sunlight from the sun or wind from the air, and so are environmentally friendly. We cover all alternative energies, but we will begin the overview with the renewable energy sources.



## **Definition: Alternative Energy -- is Broad, Means Non-Traditional**

**Alternative energy means non-traditional energy sources.**

**RTCC, 2008.** [NGO, RTCC is accredited as an official observer to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change process, "Glossary," p. o/l: <http://www.rtcc.org/2007/html/glossary.html>.]

alternative energy - energy derived from nontraditional sources (e.g., compressed natural gas, solar, hydroelectric, wind).

**Alternative energy is non-popular, environmentally friendly alternatives to fossil fuels.**

**NRDC, 2008.** [Natural Resources Defense Council, NGO, NRDC is the nation's most effective environmental action group, combining the grassroots power of 1.2 million members and online activists with the courtroom clout and expertise of more than 350 lawyers, scientists and other professionals, "Glossary of Environmental Terms," p. o/l: <http://www.nrdc.org/reference/glossary/a.asp>.]

alternative energy - energy that is not popularly used and is usually environmentally sound, such as solar or wind energy (as opposed to fossil fuels).

**Alternative energy is non-fossil fuel energy.**

**MMS, 2008.** [the Mineral Management Service, a bureau in the U.S. Dept. of the Interior, is the Federal agency that manages the nation's natural gas, oil and other mineral resources on the outer continental shelf (OCS), Washington, D.C., "Alternative Energy Programs," p. o/l: <http://www.mms.gov/offshore/AlternativeEnergy/Definitions.htm>.]

Alternate Energy: Fuel sources that are other than those derived from fossil fuels. Typically used interchangeably for renewable energy. Examples include: wind, solar, biomass, wave and tidal energy.

**Alternative energy doesn't use natural resources or harm the environment.**

**Princeton Wordnet, 2008.** [p. o/l: <http://wordnet.princeton.edu/perl/webwn?s=alternative%20energy>.]

alternative energy (energy derived from sources that do not use up natural resources or harm the environment)



## T: An Increase in Fossil Fuel Efficiency is NOT Alternative Energy

### Efficiency Affs are NOT Topical

( ). Two choices---A reduction in Fossil Fuel Consumption can occur through 1) better efficiency (not topical) or alternative energy (topical)

**Solomon & Freedberg, Profs Law @ GW, 90** (20 Env'tl. L. 83, "The Greenhouse...")

In order to reduce the amount of greenhouse gas dumped into our atmosphere, we must burn less fossil fuel. We can attain this goal through two techniques: (1) improve the way we use fossil fuels to make it a more efficient source of energy, and (2) find alternative energy sources that create little or no carbon gas.

( ). There is a clear distinction—we'll win the limits debate.

**Rachlinski, Prof Law Cornell, 2000** (Jeffrey, 2000 U. Ill. L. Rev. 299)

Rather than spend public resources promoting green electricity or negotiating the next round of global climate change treaties, the United States should commit itself to developing a cheap alternative to fossil fuels. Instead of trying to conquer the social and cognitive limitations of the human mind, such a program would take advantage of human motivation, determination, and imagination.

( ). They allow any fuel efficiency case to become topical. They explode the topic.

**Solomon & Freedberg, Profs Law @ GW, 90** (20 Env'tl. L. 83, "The Greenhouse...")

The United States uses sixty-three percent of the oil it consumes for transportation, with most used to fuel passenger cars. We can achieve significant reductions in carbon gas emissions by making cars more fuel efficient. Much of the remaining fossil fuel is consumed through the use of household appliances and electric lighting. The potential is great that more efficient appliances and lights will enter the market by the year 2000. In fact, Congress passed two laws in 1988 that adopt higher mandatory efficiency standards for the production of everything from light bulbs to air conditioners and freezers.

Switching industrial facilities from oil and coal to natural gas will also reduce carbon gas emissions. Not only does natural gas burn cleaner and more efficiently, but gas facilities cost less to construct. Furthermore, worldwide natural gas reserves are abundant.



## Definition: Alternative Energy -- is Divided into Two Categories, Renewables and Non-Renewables

**Alternative energy is divided into two categories of either renewable or non-renewable sources of one or more of the following.**

Walter Youngquist, 2000. [Professor of Geology at the University of Oregon, author of *GeoDestinies: The inevitable control of Earth resources over nations and individuals*, "Alternative Energy Sources," October 2000, o/I: <http://www.hubbartpeak.com/youngquist/altenergy.htm>.]

Alternative energy sources must be compared with oil in all these various attributes when their substitution for oil is considered. None appears to completely equal oil. But oil, like other fossil fuels, is a finite resource. True, there will always be oil in the Earth, but eventually the cost to recover what remains will be beyond the value of the oil. Also, a time will be reached when the amount of energy needed to recover the oil is equals or exceeds the energy in the recovered oil, at which point oil production becomes no more than a break-even, or a net energy loss situation. Oil being the most important of our fuels today, the term "alternative energy" is commonly taken to mean all other energy sources and is used here in that context. Realizing that oil is finite in practical terms, there is increasing attention given to what alternative energy sources are available to replace oil. The imperative to pursue alternative energy sources is clearly established by two simple facts. The world now uses more than 26 billion barrels of oil a year, but new discoveries (not existing field additions) in recent years have been averaging less than seven billion barrels yearly. The peak of world oil discoveries was in the mid-1960's. Inevitably, the time of the peak of world oil production must follow, with most current estimates ranging from the year 2003 (Campbell, 1997) to 2020 (Edwards, 1997). Significantly, all estimates of production peak dates are within the lifetimes of most people living today. The amount of energy an individual can directly or indirectly command largely determines that individual's material standard of living. This, of course, also applies to nations as a whole. To provide adequate energy for future generations introduces the concept of sustainability. What significant energy sources can be drawn on indefinitely? "Sustainable" is a popular and pleasant word, but when it is used it needs to be clearly defined and placed within certain parameters. The term "sustainable growth" is popular with Chambers of Commerce as well as with corporations, but if this means increase in use of any resource, including land for more people, more water for more people, and more and more food, or more "things", then the term "sustainable growth" is an oxymoron (Bartlett, 1994). Growth in terms of numbers of anything cannot be sustained indefinitely. Sustainable growth in terms of better medical care, improved sanitation, and other related qualities of life, and of intellectual endeavors, among other things, is possible, and should be a continual goal. Any consideration of "sustainable" must also be framed in the concept of a fixed size of population. People use resources. And all energy resources, even solar energy, are limited (Hardin, 1993). The problem of population size is politically sensitive and therefore largely avoided in discussions. But the energy problem cannot be sustainably solved if the demand target is a continually growing population. It is important to keep this overriding fact in mind. Eventually it will have to be faced. In defining a sustainable society, it is also necessary to determine what a reasonable standard of living is to be achieved. This does not lend itself to an easy definition as various cultures have differing views. In considering what significant (in terms of quantity and quality) sustainable alternative energy sources may exist, the factors of population and living standards must be addressed. These matters are beyond this discussion, which simply presents the basic facts of alternative energy sources. How these sources, with their advantages and limitations may be applied to society at large is here left for economists, sociologists, and politicians. Energy interchangeability. There is much casual popular thought that energy sources are easily interchangeable. "When we run out of oil we will go to alternative fuels." "We can run our cars on solar energy." Such statements are legion. But the transition to alternative fuels will not be simple nor as convenient as is the use of oil today, and it will involve much time and financial investment. Energy carriers in terms of varied end uses and ease of handling and storage, are not easily interchangeable. We here briefly examine alternative energy sources as to their advantages, limitations, and their prospects for replacing oil in the ways and great volumes in which we use oil today. Alternative energies closest to conventional oil (from wells) are first considered, and then our energy horizons are expanded. Energy sources can be divided into renewable and nonrenewable.

### Alternative Energy Sources

#### Nonrenewable

Oil sands, heavy oil  
Natural gas  
Coal  
Shale oil  
Gas hydrates  
Nuclear fission  
Geothermal<sup>1</sup>

1. Renewable for space heating

#### Renewable

Wood/other biomass  
Hydro-electric power<sup>2</sup>  
Solar energy  
Wind energy  
Wave energy  
Tidal power  
Fusion  
Ocean thermal energy conversion

2. Not renewable with reservoirs



## Definition: Alternative Energy -- 6 Main Types

**There are six main forms of alternative energy which exist now. The problem with increasing is the political will.**

**Cnn.com, 2006.** [Principle Voices is a non-profit that is stimulating discussion on the major challenges facing the world today. As in previous years, Principal Voices is bringing together some of the world's leading thinkers in their respective fields. In 2008 we will be discussing the Economics of Energy, Design for Good and Climate Change, "Are Sun and Wind the Energy Answers?"p. o/l: <http://www.principalvoices.com/2006/environment/alternative.energy.html>]

The most common 'alternative' energy source, hydro-electric power, amounts for just 2.15% of total global primary energy supply, according to data from the International Energy Agency. Wind power makes up 0.05% and solar less than 0.04%. Growth in renewable sources, especially for anything other than electricity generation, remains slow, requiring major global efforts for them to have a meaningful impact. Some **proponents of alternative energies argue that technology is not the issue, given that most of the methods have been around for decades. Instead, they say, it is simply the political will that us lacking. The main forms of alternative energy are: Hydro-electric power:** The longest-established alternative source - water wheels have been used for hundreds of years - hydro power accounts for almost a fifth of all electricity generated worldwide. Harnessing the energy contained in water flowing to a lower elevation, it is highly efficient but limited by the necessity of suitable natural sites. For example, mountainous Kyrgyzstan in Central Asia produces 90 percent of all its electricity by hydropower - not an option in, say, the Netherlands. **Solar:** Sunlight contains many thousand times more energy than humans use but harnessing it can be expensive. The most common method, photovoltaic cells, which turn light directly in electricity, work at a maximum efficiency of little more than 15 percent and are also expensive to buy. The few existing commercial solar power stations are huge - the biggest, in Southern California's Mojave Desert, covers 1,000 acres. An even bigger facility is being built nearby. Edison International's project uses mirrors to reflect heat onto Stirling engines, a near-200 year old design in which sunlight heats hydrogen, which in turn moves pistons to generate power. When completed the site will generate enough power for almost 280,000 homes. **Wind:** The sight of massive wind turbines gently whirring atop a cliff or hill is increasingly common, particularly in parts of northern Europe, such as Germany and Denmark. However, such 'wind farms' have prompted a bitter divide among environmentalists, with some green campaigners arguing long ranks of turbines scar the countryside, can make noise and kill too many birds and bats with their blades. One alternative is to site wind farms offshore, but this makes them more expensive to maintain - not to mention a potential shipping hazard. **Wave and tidal power:** Thus far a negligible contributor, with only a few mainly experimental sites worldwide. The most common prototypes use the kinetic energy of ebbing and flowing tides by trapping water in barrages, which then powers turbines. **Nuclear:** Even mentioning nuclear power in the same breath as renewable energies is sacrilege to many environmentalists. But proponents argue that modern reactors are safer and more efficient than those used in the past, as well as being powerful enough to have a real impact on fossil fuel use. **[Alternative] Fossil fuels:** Still more controversially, Professor Mark Jaccard at Vancouver's Simon Fraser University, insists oil, coal and gas are still the way forward. He argues that there are enough resources to last at least another 500 years and that burning fossil fuels more cleanly - for example 'capturing' carbon dioxide emissions underground - is the most feasible way of saving the environment.



## Definition: Alternative Energy -- is Distinct from Hydrogen Fuel

**Hydrogen fuel cells are related but distinct from alternative energy.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

An area related to alternative energy is hydrogen fuel cells for cars. A hydrogen fuel cell is a device that is being developed which will run a car using only hydrogen as fuel, to reduce the demand for gasoline and foreign oil and to promote green energy. The exhaust from cars is one of the chief factors in air pollution and this technology will enable cars that will have no exhaust. The technology involves a chemical reaction with hydrogen and oxygen that produces electricity, with water as the only created waste product. Many companies are involved in the research and development of hydrogen fuel cells and this will be a very hot area in the near future. The only problem with hydrogen fuel cells is that there is a cost to produce the hydrogen used as fuel.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Alternative Oil or Gas

**Alternative energy can be exploration of alternative oil and natural gas deposits.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Aside from renewable energy, there are also alternative energy areas in oil and natural gas, which consists of alternative oil and gas exploration. The traditional reserves of oil and natural gas are becoming depleted, and the global economy's insatiable demand for energy will make previously untapped reserves of oil and natural gas highly profitable. Alternative oil and gas exploration will find and exploit deposits of oil and gas that will help serve to supply energy to the global demand as resources become scarce. The various forms of alternative oil and gas exploration include oil sand, shale oil, basin centered gas accumulation, tight gas, and coal bed methane, as well as other areas.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Not Be Green Building or Emissions Credits

**Emissions credits and green building are similar but distinct from alternative energies.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

An area that relates to alternative energy in terms of being friendly to the environment is green building. Green building consists of erecting buildings that are environmentally sound and energy efficient. This can be done through better heating insulation, more efficient electrical appliances such as fluorescent lighting, and other structural elements. Green building is environmentally friendly, and it also saves money because it reduces energy consumption. Another green idea is pollution credits. Pollution credits, also called emissions trading, is a program in which the government establishes a total limit for pollution, and companies that pollute less can sell their right to pollute to the companies that pollute more. This creates a financial incentive to cut pollution. Green building, pollution credits and public transportation can all contribute to reducing pollution and saving the environment.



## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Batteries/Development Of

**Alternative energy can be the development and implementation of battery technology.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Another way to reduce global oil consumption is through conservation of gasoline and battery-powered cars. Cars that are lighter and more energy efficient, which can get better mileage-per-gallon, significantly reduce the quantity of gasoline that is required for transportation demand. Electric cars, which run on electricity and can be plugged in to get their energy source, are an alternative to gasoline-powered cars. Plug-in hybrids can run on gasoline or on electricity, and there are also hybrid cars that augment their gasoline usage with motion-generated battery power. Hybrid cars have had some success and most major car companies have hybrid car programs.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Solar

**Alternative energy can be solar power.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

We cover all alternative energies, but we will begin the overview with the renewable energy sources. Solar power arises from the light of the sun, which can be harnessed through the use of solar power cells, which are also called photovoltaic cells. Sunlight is easy to harness and free, but it can be difficult to harness solar power for large scale power plants. However, there are several solar power plant projects in existence. Solar power has a great deal of potential in the field of home electricity generation. Solar power is attractive because sunlight is free and the only cost involved is the cost of solar panels. Solar is also very environmentally friendly, as it produces no pollution or waste byproduct, and it is therefore essential for a greener future. Solar panels come in various sizes and can be used on a small scale by mounting solar panels on a house for home electricity production, or they can be used on a large scale for electricity production. Solar is most commonly used for on-site local electricity production, by adding solar panels to the roofs of homes or commercial buildings. It is often used by consumers who want to help the environment, and also plays a vital role in supplying power to buildings that cannot easily access power lines. The three common solar power technologies are silicon, thin-film, and solar thermal.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Wind

**Alternative energy can be wind power.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

We cover all alternative energies, but we will begin the overview with the renewable energy sources... Wind power is also a very attractive field. Wind technology has grown in scope, and in various places wind is becoming a feasible source of energy. Wind has a lot of potential and investors should keep an eye on it. Wind is vulnerable to weather conditions, but in certain locations, mainly in coastal offshore areas and at high altitudes, there is a steady stream of wind. Wind power is harnessed through the use of wind turbines, which are turned by the wind to produce electricity. The technology is not unlike a more modern and sophisticated version of a windmill. Wind power can be used both for electricity production on a large scale with multiple turbines to form what is called a wind farm, or in other words a wind power plant, or, more infrequently, on a smaller scale for home electricity production. Wind power is the most persecuted of all forms of renewable energy, as there is a multi-national anti-wind lobby that accuses wind turbines of being ugly, noisy, interfering with radars and killing birds, all of which are completely unjustified claims.



## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Geothermal

**Alternative energy can be geothermal power.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

We cover all alternative energies, but we will begin the overview with the renewable energy sources...

Geothermal energy is also an exciting new area. Geothermal energy draws heat from the planet's core. Thermal power stations are set up which absorb energy from the planet. The heat from the planet boils a liquid which evaporates to turn turbines, producing the electricity. This technology is feasible because thermal heat is free and the only cost is the station. However, the locations where geothermal heat is easily available are limited and change based on tectonic movement and the arrangement of the surface of the Earth. Geothermal is renewable and does not pollute, and there are places in many parts of the world that are seeking geothermal power. Geothermal is also very well suited for home heating and cooling, in which pipes are placed underground and a liquid is circulated through them, so that heat from the ground comes up during cold times, and cool from the ground comes up during hot times. Geothermal heating is becoming very popular, and is a cost-effective alternative to oil or gas home heating.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Hydro/Tidal/Wave

**Alternative energy can be hydroelectric power or tidal power.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

A highly developed form of alternative energy is hydroelectric. Hydroelectric power comes from dams which harness the power of rivers. The river water passes through turbines at the base of the dam, turning turbines which produce electricity. There are many dams in existence, and hydroelectric is a highly developed technology. There are dams in America, China, and elsewhere in the world. Hydroelectric is a clean, green technology which produces no pollution. Unfortunately, most of the lakes and rivers that could easily be exploited with hydroelectric have been dammed already, so the future of hydroelectric power lies in the development of less appealing sites. There are a number of hydroelectric projects in existence, in Africa, Asia and elsewhere. Tidal power and wave power are two ocean-based technologies with high potential for providing clean, free energy in the future. Tidal power works when ocean water flows through tidal power stations as the water goes in and out with the tide, turning the turbines and producing electricity. Tidal power is not widely used, but as it develops it could become a very big thing. There are high potential tidal sites with very strong tides around the world, in Eastern Canada and Scotland among other places. Another renewable energy with high worldwide potential is wave power. Wave power seeks to convert waves into electricity by placing equipment on the oceans that captures wave movement and converts it into power. There are also efforts to harvest energy from the salt content and temperature of the ocean. The oceans of the world offers a huge possibility for electricity generation projects, and most of this potential is so far untapped and waiting to be explored.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Renewable

**Renewables are a sub-set of alternative energy. Alternative energy can be renewable.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

An overview of the various kinds of alternative energy follows. At the outset we must differentiate between alternative energy, and renewable energy. Alternative energy refers to any form of energy which is an alternative to the traditional fossil fuels of oil, natural gas and coal. Renewable energy are the forms of alternative energy that are renewed by the natural processes of the Earth, such as sunlight from the sun or wind from the air, and so are environmentally friendly. We cover all alternative energies, but we will begin the overview with the renewable energy sources.





## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Biomass

**Alternative energy can be biomass tech.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Another interesting alternative energy source is the development of biomass technology. Biomass is a term for any kind of organic biological matter that can be converted into energy. Biomass technology is being created that will enable dung, for example from cows or pigs, or dead vegetable matter to be converted into energy. The transformation of these common substances, which would otherwise end up as waste, into electricity is an exciting area that has a great deal of potential to produce energy from previously untapped sources without polluting the environment. Biomass is usually either plant matter, from either crops or forest waste, or fecal wastes. A subsection of biomass is biogas, natural gas produced from biological sources.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Biofuel

**Alternative energy can be biofuel and biodiesel.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

A similar and very exciting alternative energy area is biofuel. Biofuel is liquid fuel made from biomass, usually from plant matter. Biofuel is an exciting prospect because it will enable farmers to turn excess crops into fuel. The biofuel that is the main focus of research is ethanol, a form of biofuel that can be made from corn or sugarcane. Ethanol can be used to run cars, and there is an increasing interest in the use of ethanol to replace or augment gasoline as a significant source of automotive fuel. Cars must be specially fitted to run on ethanol, but the price is worth it, as ethanol burns more cleanly than gasoline, producing fewer pollutants, and it can be made from domestic crops, reducing dependence on foreign oil. Ethanol from sugarcane already makes up about forty percent of the fuel used by automobiles in Brazil, and this is a huge factor in Brazil's energy independence. In the United States the ethanol is made from corn, a plentiful crop in the American Midwest, and the United States government has ethanol initiatives and mandates to promote the use of ethanol. Additionally, there are many American states with their own ethanol initiatives and mandates. Major car companies are building ethanol-powered cars, and gas stations are creating ethanol fueling stations, and the use of ethanol is definitely on the rise. Gasoline can be combined with ethanol to create gasohol, and a popular form is E85, a blend of eighty-five percent ethanol and fifteen percent gasoline. There is also E10 and E15. Cars called "flex-fuel" cars are available that are flexible in their fuel use, meaning that they are able to run on either gasoline or ethanol. There is a form of ethanol called cellulose ethanol, being developed in research laboratories, which is made from inedible biomass and burns more cleanly than normal ethanol. Another form of biofuel is biodiesel, a fuel that is like diesel but which is made from biomass. Biodiesel can be used in any engine that run on diesel, making the switch to biodiesel very easy, and it is widely useful. Biodiesel can be made from waste vegetable oils produces from cooking, and also from palm oil and canola oil, and from jatropa plants. Biofuel is a high potential area as it will have a real effect in reducing our dependence upon foreign oil for gasoline consumption, which is a key element in our addiction to oil, and as global demand for oil grows the use of ethanol and biodiesel will grow as well.



## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Oil Sand/Shale Oil

**Alternative energy can be shale oil or oil sand.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Two kinds of alternative oil exploration are oil sand, which is also called tar sand, and shale oil. Oil sand is a kind of sand from which oil can be extracted. There are large oil sand reserves in western Canada, centered in the Alberta region, so much so that it makes Canada a major potential source of oil on equal footing with the Middle East, and the exploration of oil sand is a very hot area. A growing oil extraction infrastructure has grown up around the Canadian oil sands, and there are many opportunities in that area. Shale oil is another kind of energy consisting of oil pressed from shale. There are shale oil reserves in Utah and elsewhere, and this is a very interesting field. Companies are competing for the rights to develop shale oil, and as the infrastructure comes on line shale oil could produce a lot of oil. Oil sand and shale oil represent sources of oil that have not been previously tapped, and if the oil can be extracted through cost effective methods then oil sand and shale oil could become highly profitable, as they will produce oil from nontraditional reserves that have not been depleted in a future when most traditional resources will have run out. This area is very exciting for energy companies as the traditional sources of oil dry up, and there are many companies currently working to exploit oil sand and shale oil reserves.

## Definition: Alternative Energy -- Can Be Natural Gas

**Alternative energy can be exploration of alternative natural gas deposits.**

Russell **Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.alteneews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Methods of alternative natural gas exploration include basin centered gas accumulation, in which gas in a basin is extracted, tight gas, in which the gas is difficult to get to, coal bed methane, in which natural gas is extracted from coal beds, and gas to liquid technology, in which natural gas from distant locations is converted to a liquid for the purpose of transportation. It should be noted that natural gas is the cleanest of all the fossil fuels in terms of the toxic emissions released when it is burned, and it can be useful for electricity generation and home heating. These technologies should be closely watched as traditional oil and gas reserves become depleted.

Our interpretation is better because "alternative energy supplies" or "alternative energy sources" could have a different meaning...broader than simply renewable energy. Alternative energy is about energy sources that are distinct from (alternative to, solutions for, replacements of, defaults to) "conventional fossil fuel supplies."



## Definition: Alternative Energy Incentives -- (Categories)

**Alternative energy incentives falls under one of these categories:**

**Russell Hasan, 2008.** [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, non-profit Alternative Energy News Source that offers news, commentary and analysis relating to the alternative energy industry, helping environmentalists learn new and better ways to help achieve a green, clean environment. "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

### Financial Incentives

#### Corporate Deduction

Energy Efficient Commercial Buildings Tax Deduction

#### Corporate Depreciation

Modified Accelerated Cost-Recovery System (MACRS) + Bonus Depreciation

#### Corporate Exemption

Residential Energy Conservation Subsidy Exclusion (Corporate)

#### Corporate Tax Credit

Business Energy Tax Credit

Energy Efficient Appliance Tax Credit for Manufacturers

Energy-Efficient New Homes Tax Credit for Home Builders

Renewable Electricity Production Tax Credit (PTC)

#### Federal Grant Program

Tribal Energy Program Grant

USDA Renewable Energy Systems and Energy Efficiency Improvements Program

#### Federal Loan Program

Clean Renewable Energy Bonds (CREBs)

Energy Efficient Mortgage

USDA Renewable Energy Systems and Energy Efficiency Improvements Program

#### Personal Exemption

Residential Energy Conservation Subsidy Exclusion (Personal)

#### Personal Tax Credit

Residential Energy Efficiency Tax Credit

Residential Solar and Fuel Cell Tax Credit

#### Production Incentive

Renewable Energy Production Incentive (REPI)

#### Alternative Fuel and Vehicle Incentives

U.S. Department of Energy's Alternative Fuels Data Center



## Definition: Alternative Energy Incentives -- is Tax Incentives

**Alternative energy incentives can be tax incentives that take on 4 levels: income, corporate, property, and sales tax. US Dept. of Energy, 2008.** [February 8, "State Energy Alternatives," p. o/l: [http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax\\_incentives.cfm](http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax_incentives.cfm).]

Some states have created tax incentives to encourage the development of markets for energy efficiency and renewable energy. Tax incentive programs to encourage renewable energy are designed to facilitate the purchase, installation, or manufacture of renewable energy systems, equipment, and facilities. The goal of these programs is to reduce the investment costs of acquiring and installing renewable energy systems and equipment. They reward investors with tax credits, deductions, and allowances for their support of renewable energy sources. Instruments include income, corporate, property, and sales tax incentives. Eligible technologies may include solar and photovoltaic energy systems, geothermal energy, wind energy, biomass, hydroelectric, and alternative fuel technologies. Tax incentives are varied. Most are implemented through tax credits, allowances, and deductions. A few states have expiration dates, and some limit the time the incentive is available after the installation or purchase date. Income Tax Some states offer taxpaying residents a tax deduction from adjusted gross income, to cover the expense of conversion equipment that switches their main energy source from gas or electricity to renewable energy sources. Some states offer personal income tax credits up to a certain percentage or predetermined dollar amount for the cost or installation of renewable energy equipment. Allowable tax credit percentage rates vary between 5% and 40%. Available credit may be limited to a certain number of years following the purchase or installation of renewable energy equipment. Corporate Much like income tax incentives, corporate incentives allow corporations to receive credits ranging from 10% to 35% for the costs of equipment and related expenditures for renewable energy systems. Tax incentives also may be awarded to industrial and commercial corporations that provide energy savings or recycle waste. Some states allow the tax credit only if a corporation has invested a certain dollar amount in a given project. Examples of incentives include tax deductions for solar or wind space and water heating equipment, and deductions for any income received from royalties related to patents that encourage energy savings or alternative energy development. Property State property tax incentives are more frequently available than any other type of tax incentives for renewable energy. Tax incentives range from straightforward local property exemptions for renewable energy systems, to special assessment of property with value-added by a renewable energy source. Sales Sales tax incentives typically exempt purchases of renewable energy equipment from the sales tax.

**Alternative energy incentives is tax incentives.**

**US Dept. of Energy, 2008.** [February 8, "State Energy Alternatives," p. o/l: [http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax\\_incentives.cfm](http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax_incentives.cfm).]

Tax incentives to encourage energy efficiency include income, corporate, property, and sales incentives. Most are implemented through tax credits, allowances, and deductions. States often have expiration dates for their incentive plans. Most incentives last 5-10 years with an option to renew. In addition, some states limit the length of time the incentive is available after the installation or equipment purchase date. Income Many states offer taxpaying state residents an income tax deduction from their adjusted gross income to cover a portion of the expense of energy efficient equipment. Current policies allow a credit or deduction of 5%-40% of expenses. Available credit may be limited to a certain number of years following the purchase or installation. Corporate Much like income tax incentives, many corporate tax incentives allow corporations to receive credits of 10%-35% against the cost of energy efficient equipment or installation of that equipment. Property Property tax incentives range from straightforward local property exemptions to special assessment of property with value added by energy efficiency equipment. Sales Sales tax incentives typically exempt state sales tax from the cost or installation of energy efficiency equipment. As with other policy programs, the way the tax incentives are designed and implemented is critical to program success. In addition to providing a tax incentive, funds should also be set aside for implementing and evaluating these incentives as appropriate.



## 1NC: Incentives -- Must Be To Undetermined Third Party

### A. Interpretation:

**Incentive means a reward offered for taking a particular action.**

**Merriam-Webster Dictionary, 2008.**

in·cen·tive

Pronunciation: \in-'sen-tiv\

*noun* : something that incites or has a tendency to incite to determination or action

**B. Violation: The affirmative does not provide an incentive to someone to do something, they only have the USFG do**

---

---

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Limits** – there are an infinite number of actors and agencies and people to offer incentives to in the U.S. Allowing the affirmative to specify who benefits from increased incentives explodes the topic and allows for small affs who don't link to anything.
2. **Ground** – their aff is our ground. Allowing them to specify who gets the incentives guts negative ground since we don't get links to object-dependent disads, counterplans, and kritiks.
3. **Predictable Education** – By allowing them to specify who gets the incentive, they moot topical education on the effects of widespread incentives which is where most of the literature base lies. They will claim we still get education about 'x' but the affirmative limits that education to just themselves since the negative never could have predicted their super-focused incentives.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**



## 1NC: Incentives -- No Worse Off Test (Pressure is not T) 1/2

### A. Interpretation:

**Incentives are distinct from pressure. Incentives produce choice, pressure produces counterpressure.**

Roger **Fisher**, Harvard law professor and director of the Harvard Negotiation Project, **1993**.  
[Roger, ATLANTA JOURNAL AND CONSTITUTION, April 25, p. G1]

The starting point in designing a strategy to exert influence is to understand how those we are seeking to influence currently perceive their choices. If we want someone to change his mind, where do we think his mind is now? In Beirut, Iran, El Salvador, South Africa and elsewhere, I have found a "perceived choice chart" to be a valuable tool in designing strategy for changing someone's mind. And if a chart is constructed for cult leader David Koresh, as I recently did and sent to the FBI, one can see few incentives for him to surrender. Whether or not Mr. Koresh was an irrational man, he would not have to be irrational to refuse surrender. Whatever his value system, it must have looked better for Mr. Koresh to stay in the compound as the leader than to lose his leadership role and submit himself to a murder trial. Pain is not pressure. The word "**pressure**" tends to suggest that if we increase discomfort and threaten worse, it is likely to cause someone else to make a decision we would like them to make. Actually, threats tend to produce counterthreats. The critical aspect is the difference between the expected consequences of saying "yes" and those of saying "no."

**They must pass the 'no-worse-off test.' If saying 'no' to the plan's 'incentives' makes them worse-off than the status quo, the affirmative plan is not topical.**

William **Long**, Georgia Institute of Technology's Sam Nunn School of International Affairs professor, **1996**. [William J., INTERNATIONAL STUDIES QUARTERLY, Spring, p. 83.]

In contrast, the offer of an economic incentive providing new gains from trade and technology transfer does not create in the recipient a strong desire to undermine the influence attempt by seeking an alternative supplier. Furthermore, incentives do not create economic conditions that encourage new entrants or third-party suppliers to offset the sender's efforts. When an incentive is offered, the potential recipient can choose to reject it and maintain its political autonomy, leaving it no worse off than before.

**B. Violation: The plan fails the no-worse-off rejection test – it does not intend that they are not worse off assuming a rejection of incentives and results in a 'forced choice' in accepting the incentives.**

---

### C. Reasons to prefer:

1. **Ground** – they moot counterplan, disad, and solvency ground. We should be able to counterplan with pressure or alternative incentives. We lose all of our solvency arguments on incentives failing.
2. **Literature** – Their plan is not in the literature as an incentive.
3. **Explodes the topic** – There are hundreds of ways in which we could pressure groups in the United States to increase alternative energy usage and development. If they do not have to be an increase in current incentive policy then any threat by the USFG is topical.

continued....



## 1NC: Incentives -- No Worse Off Test (Pressure is not T) 2/2

4. **Moots incentives** – If the plan coerces or forces businesses to say no, there's no meaning to incentives. There must be a choice involved. How is the plan any different than the USFG simply mandating an increase in alternative energy?
5. **Real world implications – coercion makes bad policy.**

William Long, Georgia Institute of Technology's Sam Nunn School of International Affairs professor, 1996. [William J., INTERNATIONAL STUDIES QUARTERLY, Spring, p. 83.]

Scholars who have examined decision-maker cognition and choice as a source of national preferences tell us that decision-makers often used established images to filter information and to resist negative feedback once committed to a course of action (Jervis, 1970). Some suggest that warnings, threats, and the possibility of loss often lead decision-makers to be insensitive to information critical of their policies; a pattern of avoidance (Janis and Man, 1997).

6. They unlimit—pressure allows banning any fossil fuel for any purpose, exploding topic.

**Rachlinski**, Prof Law Cornell, 2000 (Jeffrey, 2000 U. Ill. L. Rev. 299)

Governmental intervention to remedy a commons dilemma is not new. Historically, governmental remedies for a commons problem have included taxation and regulation. n73 A taxation approach to remedying global climate change would consist of imposing some tax on fossil fuel consumption that compensates for the risk of global climate change accompanying fossil fuel consumption. In the context of environmental harm, governments typically adopt regulations that limit the costs a polluter can impose. In the context of global climate change, this approach would consist of any set of regulations designed to directly reduce the rate of fossil fuel consumption. For example, this might include banning the sale of vehicles that have less than a certain gas mileage or forbidding the use of fossil fuels for certain activities.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**



## Definition: Incentives

**Incentives means something that motivates someone to make some change.**

**Oxford English Dictionary, 2008.** [Online Oxford English Dictionary]

Incentive - a thing that motivates or encourages someone to action or increased effort.

**Incentives can be a punishment or a reward.**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

n. Something, such as the fear of punishment or the expectation of reward, that induces action or motivates effort.

**Incentive is a postive motivator.**

**WordNet, 2003. Princeton University.**

n. a positive motivational influence

**Incentives encourage.**

**Kernerman English Multilingual Dictionary, 2006.**

n. something that encourages etc

## Definitions: In

**In means 'in the bounds of.'**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

prep. Within the limits, bounds, or area of: was hit in the face; born in the spring; a chair in the garden.

**In means 'throughout a certain medium.'**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

prep. Made with or through the medium of: a statue in bronze; a note written in German.

**In means 'inside.'**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

adj. Located inside; inner.

**In means 'in reference to.'**

**American Heritage Dictionary, 2006.**

adj. Relating to, understandable to, or coming from an exclusive group

**In means 'inward.'**

**WordNet, 2006. Princeton University.**

adj. directed or bound inward; "took the in bus"; "the in basket"

**In assumes particular circumstances.**

**Kernerman English Multilingual Dictionary, 2006.**

prep. expressing circumstances, state, manner etc of an event, person, etc. Example: dressed in a brown coat; walking in the rain; in a hurry; written in English; He is in the army; books tied up in bundles; She is in her sixties.

**In means 'based upon the law of.'**

**Merriam Webster's Legal Dictionary, 1996.**

prep. under the law of : based on

**In has multiple meanings.**

**Webster's Revised, Unabridged Dictionary**

1. A relation of proximity to, or of presence in or on, something; as, at the door; at your shop; at home; at school; at hand; at sea and on land.
2. The relation of some state or condition; as, at war; at peace; at ease; at your service; at fault; at liberty; at risk; at disadvantage.
3. The relation of some employment or action; occupied with; as, at engraving; at husbandry; at play; at work; at meat (eating); except at puns.
4. The relation of a point or position in a series, or of degree, rate, or value; as, with the thermometer at 80[deg]; goods sold at a cheap price; a country estimated at 10,000 square miles; life is short at the longest.
5. The relations of time, age, or order; as, at ten o'clock; at twenty-one; at once; at first.
6. The relations of source, occasion, reason, consequence, or effect; as, at the sight; at this news; merry at anything; at this declaration; at his command; to demand, require, receive, deserve, endure at your hands.
7. Relation of direction toward an object or end; as, look at it; to point at one; to aim at a mark; to throw, strike, shoot, wink, mock, laugh at any one.





## T: Repealing Fossil Fuel Subsidies = Extra Topical action

- ( ). Legislation proves that banning fossil fuel subsidies is an action that is distinct from increasing incentives. It might be a step in the process, but it is possible to ban fossil fuel subsidies without increasing incentives. Likewise, it is possible to keep fossil fuel subsidies while increasing incentives for alternatives. **THEY ARE EXTRA-TOPICAL.**

**Glicksman**, Prof. Law U. Kansas, '06 (Robert, "Center for Progressive Reform Conference," *52 Loyola Law Review* 1127, Winter)

Critics of EPA's 2005 failure to shift the nation's energy policy toward less environmentally damaging sources of energy have sought to redress the imbalance they perceive in the government's treatment of traditional and alternative fuel sources. Legislators in the House of Representatives introduced a bill in late 2005 called the Clean Alternatives for Energy Independence Act of 2005, whose stated purpose was to "repeal tax subsidies for oil and gas enacted by the Energy Policy Act of 2005 and to use the proceeds to double certain alternative energy incentives provided for in such Act."<sup>n204</sup> The bill died in the House Committee on Ways and Means when the 109th Congress ended.

## Topicality: Government Grants for Research are NOT Incentives

- ( ). Government support of alternative energy takes many forms, one of which is incentives. Incentives—such as tax credits—are distinct from grants for research. Federal research funds are different.

Russell **Hasan**, '08. [President of Alternative Energy News Source Company, "Introduction to Alternative Energy," p. o/l: <http://www.altenews.com/Alternative%20Energy%20Overview.pdf>.]

Several factors will also make the American government support the development of alternative energy. The first is the need for energy independence. The disaster of hurricanes Katrina and Rita showed that the American supply of petroleum, based on pipelines coming from the gulf coast, is unstable due to potential bad weather conditions, and alternative energy sources will help America become less dependent upon oil pipelines. More importantly, alternative energy will also help America become less dependent upon foreign oil, particularly from the Middle East, which is in the national interest. American dependence upon foreign oil is a major issue due to the political instability of the Middle East, it involves a huge political and military commitment by the United States to peace in the Middle East, and alternative energy will help to alleviate the situation and enable America to break free from dependence upon the Middle East and foreign oil. This could help America disentangle itself from its problematic relations with Iraq, Iran, and the other major oil-producing countries of that region. In fact, the American government has already enacted several measures to promote the alternative energy industry, both giving grants for research and taking steps to make alternatives more competitive through government incentives, and more are sure to come.



## Definition: Incentives -- Are Not Coercive

### **Incentives are not coercive.**

William **Long**, Georgia Institute of Technology's Sam Nunn School of International Affairs professor, **1996**. [William J., INTERNATIONAL STUDIES QUARTERLY, Spring, p. 83.]

Incentives are less likely to produce this antidote. Because incentives are non-coercive instruments providing a tangible material benefit that some recipient actors can appropriate (as well as nontangible benefits such as recognition or legitimacy), they do not threaten the target state to indistinctively provoke rally-round-the-flag reactions, and they find natural allies in the recipient state who reinforce the sender's message and influence.

### **Incentives require a self-motivated decision.**

William **Long**, Georgia Institute of Technology's Sam Nunn School of International Affairs professor, **1996**. [William J., INTERNATIONAL STUDIES QUARTERLY, Spring, p. 83.]

Ironically, the ability of the recipient to characterize its policy adjustment in response to an incentive as self-motivated (rather than coerced) may be an important strength of incentives as a policy instrument, and yet be one of the reasons it is easy to overlook or underestimate their effects.

## Definition: Incentives -- Must Highlight Desired Action, Not Target Undesired

### **Incentives promote a desired policy, not discourage undesired policy.**

William **Long**, Georgia Institute of Technology's Sam Nunn School of International Affairs professor, **1996**. [William J., INTERNATIONAL STUDIES QUARTERLY, Spring, p. 83.]

Further, incentives, by highlighting the desired policy adaptation sought in the recipient, rather than singling out the undesired direction in another state's policies, may convey more precise and constructive information than sanctions. Incentives show the sender's desired or preferred course of adjustment rather than sanctioning an existing or anticipated policy. In this respect, incentives may perform the information-providing function of regimes in developing cooperation. Punishment does not, in itself, communicate the sender's desired response. It merely points out one of the many undesired responses. Punishments have value in indicating the sender's desire for justice or revenge, but they are less than ideal for communicating the desire or direction for long-term cooperation. In fact, they can quickly lead to communication gridlock (Raser, 1965:223). Simply put, if long-run cooperation is the goal, incentives communicate better.



## 1NC: In the United States -- is Specifically Within

### A. Interpretation:

**Their plan should have to specify where the incentives apply—they cannot simply state “in the United States.” The United States is a region, a geographic space including fifty large and small states. Which states does the assistance in the plan go to? What sectors will the incentives apply to? All of them? Will they all accept it? In equal amounts?**

**And, here's proof that incentives can happen on multiple levels benefiting multiple groups**

**US Dept. of Energy, 2008.** [February 8, “State Energy Alternatives,” p. o/l: [http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax\\_incentives.cfm](http://www.eere.energy.gov/states/alternatives/tax_incentives.cfm).]

Some states have created tax incentives to encourage the development of markets for energy efficiency and renewable energy. Tax incentive programs to encourage renewable energy are designed to facilitate the purchase, installation, or manufacture of renewable energy systems, equipment, and facilities. The goal of these programs is to reduce the investment costs of acquiring and installing renewable energy systems and equipment. They reward investors with tax credits, deductions, and allowances for their support of renewable energy sources. Instruments include income, corporate, property, and sales tax incentives. Eligible technologies may include solar and photovoltaic energy systems, geothermal energy, wind energy, biomass, hydroelectric, and alternative fuel technologies. Tax incentives are varied. Most are implemented through tax credits, allowances, and deductions. A few states have expiration dates, and some limit the time the incentive is available after the installation or purchase date. Income Tax Some states offer taxpaying residents a tax deduction from adjusted gross income, to cover the expense of conversion equipment that switches their main energy source from gas or electricity to renewable energy sources. Some states offer personal income tax credits up to a certain percentage or predetermined dollar amount for the cost or installation of renewable energy equipment. Allowable tax credit percentage rates vary between 5% and 40%. Available credit may be limited to a certain number of years following the purchase or installation of renewable energy equipment. Corporate Much like income tax incentives, corporate incentives allow corporations to receive credits ranging from 10% to 35% for the costs of equipment and related expenditures for renewable energy systems. Tax incentives also may be awarded to industrial and commercial corporations that provide energy savings or recycle waste. Some states allow the tax credit only if a corporation has invested a certain dollar amount in a given project. Examples of incentives include tax deductions for solar or wind space and water heating equipment, and deductions for any income received from royalties related to patents that encourage energy savings or alternative energy development. Property State property tax incentives are more frequently available than any other type of tax incentives for renewable energy. Tax incentives range from straightforward local property exemptions for renewable energy systems, to special assessment of property with value-added by a renewable energy source. Sales Sales tax incentives typically exempt purchases of renewable energy equipment from the sales tax.

**B. Violation: The plan does not specify the beneficiaries of incentives. At best they are extra topical.**

---

### C. Vote Negative:

1. **No Solvency** – How does the United States incentivise itself? That's like giving myself a dollar if promise to develop technology to save a dollar. They cannot explain how incentives themselves result in anything without specifying to whom.
2. **No Education** – Requiring specificity promotes better debate. It avoids bad PIC arguments based on the United States or PICing out of one state. State-specific and sector-specific incentives are more realistic and take into account real-world policy and “substantially increase” checks small plans to one state.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**



## 1NC: In the United States -- is “Throughout” the United States

### A. Interpretation:

**The resolution requires incentives to be increased across the entirety of the United States, throughout the entire territory including all 50 states and United States territories. Incentives to a few agents within the United States are not topical.**

**And, 'the' is defined as a mass noun.**

**American Heritage Dictionary 2000**

Used before a singular noun indicating that the noun is generic: The wolf is an endangered species.

**United States is all fifty states and non-state territories.**

**Word Net, 2003**

United States n 1: North American republic containing 50 states - 48 conterminous states in North America plus Alaska in northwest North America and the Hawaiian Islands in the Pacific Ocean; achieved independence in 1776 [syn: United States, United States of America, America, US, U.S., USA, U.S.A.] 2: the executive and legislative and judicial branches of the federal government of the United States [syn: United States government, United States, U.S. government, US government, U.S.]

**B. Violation: the Affirmative increases incentives that effect only one part or segment of the United States and not the entirety of the United States.**

---

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Limits** – the affirmative can target thousands of specific groups or locations to increase alternative energy incentives towards. They could read affirmatives about particular coastlines for wind energy, parts of California's population, or a battery-making factory in Tennessee, or literally anything as long as it exists within the United States, exploding the negative research burden.
2. **Ground** – The topic does not say, “increase within” or “increase in one or more states in.” Affecting whole populations is key to generic links and exclusion CPs. Negative ground is vital to fairness.
3. **Our interpretation is the only way to give “substantially meaning.”** If they can cover a sub-set of the topic region, they could always claim to meet “substantial” within their sub-region, functionally destroying the meaning of “substantially.”

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**



## Topicality: Limits Good on This Topic / Extra Topicality Extn.

- ( ). The topic specifies a type of incentive—there are multiple incentives that they make topical. Once this limit is gone, the topic becomes meaningless as any warming policy is another aff.
- ( ). Draw the line—the topic could be immense without any predictability. The debate should be what are the best incentives, not “how can we add other mechanisms into a larger package?” Vote against their extra-topical action EVEN IF it includes some topical action.
- ( ). Do not allow any climate change action to be topical. This will explode the topic, opening the floodgates to any administrative change, any form of job retraining, all the education cases, shifting of military priorities, and a dozen other major elements of warming policy, including all the possibilities of a Manufacturing Extension program.

**Pemberton**, Peace and Security Editor for *FP in Focus*, '08 (Miriam, “A Climate Change Industrial Policy,” *Foreign Policy in Focus*, May 14, [commondreams.org](http://commondreams.org))

Here are a few missing pieces from a new climate change industrial policy. The federal retraining system must prioritize “green job” retraining. The United States also needs to invest into major, new clean infrastructure. This involves not just developing new transportation technologies but spending federal dollars to upgrade and subsidize mass transit to reduce emissions. Federal purchasing can help catalyze markets. States have been way out front of the federal government in scaling up the market for electric vehicles, for example, by buying these vehicles for their own transportation fleets.

The United States also needs an expanded network of Manufacturing Extension service providers to provide technical assistance to reduce emissions. This national network of centers, analogous to the Agricultural Extension network, has been ramped down during the Bush years. Now it needs to be ramped back up, with a strengthened emphasis on assistance for retooling for clean manufacturing and energy conservation, and connected to a state network of green job retraining programs.

All of the elements of this new industrial policy will need to be coordinated by a climate change czar in the White House. That person’s job will be to make sure the pieces fit together. The climate change czar would link public investment to job retraining to technical assistance to new sources of finance for enterprise development, and pull together the various state initiatives into a coherent framework.

And where’s the money going to come from? In pivoting their forces to meet the new threat on their flank, the generals have to also release funds for this fight against climate change. New submarines can’t be used to fight terrorism - or climate change. It’s time to change our budget priorities accordingly, and create a new climate industrial complex.



## 2NC: Topicality is a Voting Issue

**Topicality is a voting issue for a couple of reasons:**

1. **Predictability** – Topicality is like tennis. If tennis players did not have to hit it over the net into a particular boxed area than they would always hit it beyond the physical area in which the opposing player could reach it ensuring no return serve. If the affirmative never presents an argument the negative is ready to respond to then there would never be any clash. This is implicated by topic specific education and our ability to learn about the given subject we have come to debate. This ensures that every team doesn't have an even record and that depth occurs over the issues discussed.
2. **Jurisdiction** – A judge only has the jurisdiction to vote on a plan of action within the purview of the topic – anything else is negative ground and should be rejected.
3. **In round abuse** – If the affirmative goes beyond the call of the resolution, my 1NC strategy is skewed out of the 1AC because my strategy is hinged on the 1AC plan text.

4. **Topicality/Framework is necessary to debate – we have to limit the meaning of words so we can have effective communication.**

Garth Kemerling, professor of philosophy at Newberry College, 1997, <http://www.philosophypages.com/lg/e05.htm>

We've seen that sloppy or misleading use of ordinary language can seriously limit our ability to create and communicate correct reasoning. As philosopher John Locke pointed out three centuries ago, the achievement of human knowledge is often hampered by the use of words without fixed signification. Needless controversy is sometimes produced and perpetuated by an unacknowledged ambiguity in the application of key terms.

We can distinguish disputes of three sorts: Genuine disputes involve disagreement about whether or not some specific proposition is true. Since the people engaged in a genuine dispute agree on the meaning of the words by means of which they convey their respective positions, each of them can propose and assess logical arguments that might eventually lead to a resolution of their differences. Merely verbal disputes, on the other hand, arise entirely from ambiguities in the language used to express the positions of the disputants. A verbal dispute disappears entirely once the people involved arrive at an agreement on the meaning of their terms, since doing so reveals their underlying agreement in belief. Apparently verbal but really genuine disputes can also occur, of course. In cases of this sort, the resolution of every ambiguity only reveals an underlying genuine dispute. Once that's been discovered, it can be addressed fruitfully by appropriate methods of reasoning. We can save a lot of time, sharpen our reasoning abilities, and communicate with each other more effectively if we watch for disagreements about the meaning of words and try to resolve them whenever we can. Kinds of Definition The most common way of preventing or eliminating differences in the use of languages is by agreeing on the definition of our terms. Since these explicit accounts of the meaning of a word or phrase can be offered in distinct contexts and employed in the service of different goals, it's useful to distinguish definitions of several kinds: A lexical definition simply reports the way in which a term is already used within a language community. The goal here is to inform someone else of the accepted meaning of the term, so the definition is more or less correct depending upon the accuracy with which it captures that usage. In these pages, my definitions of technical terms of logic are lexical because they are intended to inform you about the way in which these terms are actually employed within the discipline of logic. At the other extreme, a stipulative definition freely assigns meaning to a completely new term, creating a usage that had never previously existed. Since the goal in this case is to propose the adoption of shared use of a novel term, there are no existing standards against which to compare it, and the definition is always correct (though it might fail to win acceptance if it turns out to be inapt or useless). If I now decree that we will henceforth refer to Presidential speeches delivered in French as "glorsherfs," I have made a (probably pointless) stipulative definition. Combining these two techniques is often an effective way to reduce the vagueness of a word or phrase. These precisifying definitions begin with the lexical definition of a term but then propose to sharpen it by stipulating more narrow limits on its use. Here, the lexical part must be correct and the stipulative portion should appropriately reduce the troublesome vagueness. If the USPS announces that "proper notification of a change of address" means that an official form containing the relevant information must be received by the local post office no later than four days prior to the effective date of the change, it has offered a (possibly useful) precisifying definition.



## 2NC Extra-Topicality is a Voting Issue

**Extra-topicality is a voting issue and should be rejected for a couple of reasons:**

1. **Limits** – Allowing affirmatives to go beyond the purview of the resolution destroys any semblance of predictability for the negative. This means we cannot prepare against any number of advantage or solvency mechanisms inhibiting the ability for clash which is a pre-requisite to topic specific education.
2. **Ground** – The offense generated from unpredictable advantages and solvency mechanisms swamps generic disad and counterplan link ground which is limited by the resolution. Affirmatives would always win. Even if they win they increase negative ground that ground is unpredictable.
3. **Their ‘sever extra-topical portions’ arguments are bunk** – damage is already done because our INC strategy is predicated off IAC plan text. This leaves us one speech behind, especially because there has already been a time trade-off with us answering the extra-topical portions.

## 2NC Effects-Topicality is a Voting Issue

**Effects-topicality is a voting issue and should be rejected for a couple of reasons:**

1. **Limits** – effects topicality destroys any semblance of limits because it allows the affirmative to implement any policy that might eventually increase alternative energy incentives in the United States. This means we cannot prepare against any number of advantage or solvency mechanisms inhibiting the ability for clash which is a pre-requisite to topic specific education.
2. **Ground** – they destroy any negative ground based on the affirmative directly alternative energy incentives in the United States. It allows the affirmative to skirt around link arguments that happen in a time-based crucible because they can just say "we affect that but in a few weeks, months, or years." This decimates link uniqueness and makes it impossible for the negative to win disad or solvency turn debates.
3. **In round abuse** – INC strategy is dictated by IAC plan text thus implementation counterplans are gutted via the affirmatives ability to claim multiple steps to achieve an increase in alternative energy incentives.



## 2AC AT: Extra Topicality (it is Not a Voter)

- 1) Counter-Interpretation: sever the extra-topical portions of the plan. This solves their offense because it puts the debate back on an even playing field.
- 2) We Still Justify the Resolution: as long as our plan text is still topical we have done our job of proving the resolution sufficient warranting an affirmative ballot.
- 3) Turn – Increases Negative Ground: because there are more disadvantage links and counterplan arguments they can make. Counterplans check extra-topicality because the negative can just counterplan out of the extra-topical planks of the plan and still read their topic specific critiques, disads, and solvency arguments.
- 4) Turn – Increases Affirmative Flexibility: because it allows ingenuity on the affirmative in terms of advantage areas stemming from topical action.
- 5) We are not Extra Topical: <insert analysis here>
- 6) We still defend a topical plan—they have not disputed the topical, net beneficial option available. This is another reason it is not a voting issue—there is no non-topicality.
- 7) This increases their CP ground AND counterplans check abuse—they could PIC out of the extra-topical portion (or vice-versa) and debate that they solve the case enough to avoid the DA. No ground is lost





## 2AC AT: Effects Topicality (It is Not a Voter)

- 1) We are Not Effects Topical: <insert analysis here>
- 2) Every Affirmative is Effects Topical: because there will always be at least two steps between plan text and topical action. For example, sending assistance is not enough because that assistance has to be administered in order to be topical. Reasonability checks any blatant abuses of effects topicality and should be evaluated first.
- 3) At Worst: stick us to the plan text and any advantage stemming from extra steps in the plan can be rejected.
- 4) We Still Justify the Resolution: as long as our plan text is still topical we have done our job of proving the resolution sufficient warranting an affirmative ballot.
- 5) Turn – Increases Negative Ground: because there are more disadvantage links and counterplan arguments they can make off extra steps. Counterplans check effects-topicality because the negative can just counterplan out of the effects-topical planks of the plan and still read their topic specific critiques, disads, and solvency arguments.
- 6) Literature Checks: because all of our steps have to lead to topical action and we have to have a solvency advocate for which checks their predictability arguments.
- 7) Turn – Increases Affirmative Flexibility: because it allows ingenuity on the affirmative in terms of advantage areas stemming from topical action.



## 1NC: Should -- Is the Past Tense of Shall

### A. Interpretation:

**Should is the past tense of shall.**  
Merriam-Webster Online Dictionary

**B. Violation: The affirmative expresses an obligation to the future. Affirmative's should have to defend past action by the United States Federal Government.**

---

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Limits** – Our interpretation narrows the focus of the topic to past alternative energy incentives by the United States Federal Government. This allows for predictable debates in which the negative gets to test the desirability of past actions.
2. **Ground** – Gives the negative plenty of room to research disadvantage links and counterplan ground based on real world events and politics.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**

---

## 2NC: Should -- Is the Past Tense of Shall

**Our interpretation of the topic is that the word should is the past tense of shall which means any affirmative should prove that a past United States Federal Government increase in alternative energy incentives is desirable. This is good for a few reasons:**

1. **Limits** – our interpretation confines debate to the literature, which makes it predictable for the negative and encourages more in depth debates. We limit out the millions of cases affirmative's could run that are future actions that the United States Federal Government could possibly come up with.
2. **Ground** – all of our ground would be based in past real world events making disad links and solvency arguments more predictable. This increases topic specific education.

**Topicality is a voting issue for the reasons above and competitive equity because the way the affirmative has written their plan text has already unduly balanced the debate in their favor.**



## 1NC: Should -- Is the Future Obligation

### A. Interpretation:

**The word should implies an obligation to the future.**  
**American Heritage Dictionary, 2000**

Usage Note: Like the rules governing the use of shall and will on which they are based, the traditional rules governing the use of should and would are largely ignored in modern American practice. Either should or would can now be used in the first person to express conditional futurity: If I had known that, I would (or somewhat more formally, should) have answered differently. But in the second and third persons only would is used: If he had known that, he would (not should) have answered differently. Would cannot always be substituted for should, however. Should is used in all three persons in a conditional clause: if I (or you or he) should decide to go. Should is also used in all three persons to express duty or obligation (the equivalent of ought to): I (or you or he) should go. On the other hand, would is used to express volition or promise: I agreed that I would do it. Either would or should is possible as an auxiliary with like, be inclined, be glad, prefer, and related verbs: I would (or should) like to call your attention to an oversight. Here would was acceptable on all levels to a large majority of the Usage Panel in an earlier survey and is more common in American usage than should. Should have is sometimes incorrectly written should of by writers who have mistaken the source of the spoken contraction should've. See Usage Note at if. See Usage Note at rather. See Usage Note at shall.

### B. Violation: the affirmative does a counterfactual or genealogy.

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Limits** – The affirmative's interpretation confines us to alternative energy incentives increases that have already happened. This limits down most areas of the topic to at most a few cases, if any, and destroys education about current events that are of relevance to US energy policy.
2. **Ground** – Our interpretation ensures uniqueness to disadvantages – this allows negatives to make arguments that happen in a time-based crucible.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**

---

## 2NC: Should -- Is the Future Obligation

**Our interpretation of the topic is that affirmative's plans should be obligations for the future and present. The affirmative fails to meet this interpretation because they are a counterfactual/genealogy. Prefer our interpretation of the topic:**

1. **Limits** – their interpretation limits debates down to past alternative energy incentives increases within the United States. This limits out new technologies and exploration of alternatives that didn't exist years ago and destroys education about current events that could be addressed in the status quo like Saudi Arabia's refusal to increase oil production or our relationship with OPEC.
2. **Ground** – they destroy any debate that happens in a uniqueness-based crucible. Negatives would never win because the affirmative could just read a 1000 alternative causalities to your disad impact or non-unique the link. It would all be case debate.

**Topicality is a voting issue for the reasons above and competitive equity because the way the affirmative has written their plan text has already unduly balanced the debate in their favor.**



## 2AC AT: 'Should is the Past Tense of Shall'

1. We meet: our plan says 'should'. This interpretation just changes the meaning of the plan. It doesn't prove it isn't topical.
2. Ungrammatical: their interpretation assumes should is follow by 'have' which it's not. Grammar is key because it defines ground.
3. Crushes negative ground: hindsight is 20/20, so affirmative's would always be able to pick unbeatable advantage areas.
4. Counter-interpretation: Should means future action

American Heritage Dictionary 2000

[should

aux.v. Past tense of shall

Used to express obligation or duty: You should send her a note.]

5. Prefer our interpretation: any other interpretation relies on older variations of the English language.

American Heritage Dictionary 2000

[Usage Note: Like the rules governing the use of shall and will on which they are based, the traditional rules governing the use of should and would are largely ignored in modern American practice. Either should or would can now be used in the first person to express conditional futurity: If I had known that, I would (or somewhat more formally, should) have answered differently. But in the second and third persons only would is used: If he had known that, he would (not should) have answered differently. Would cannot always be substituted for should, however. Should is used in all three persons in a conditional clause: if I (or you or he) should decide to go. Should is also used in all three persons to express duty or obligation (the equivalent of ought to): I (or you or he) should go. On the other hand, would is used to express volition or promise: I agreed that I would do it. Either would or should is possible as an auxiliary with like, be inclined, be glad, prefer, and related verbs: I would (or should) like to call your attention to an oversight. Here would was acceptable on all levels to a large majority of the Usage Panel in an earlier survey and is more common in American usage than should. ·Should have is sometimes incorrectly written should of by writers who have mistaken the source of the spoken contraction should've. See Usage Note at if. See Usage Note at rather. See Usage Note at shall.]

6. Our interpretation is best:
  - a. Key to affirmative ground – the best literature supports prescriptive future action.
  - b. Key to negative ground – all of their disads assume future action, otherwise they'd be non-unique.
  - c. Ours solves their offense because future genealogical affirmatives can explore history.
7. Potential abuse isn't a voting issue – actual abuse can be countered when it occurs.



## 1NC: A-Spec

### A. Interpretation:

**Our interpretation of the topic is that the affirmative must specify the Executive, Legislative or Judicial Branch of the United States Federal Government located in Washington, D.C as the actor of their plan.**

### B. Violation: The affirmative fails to specify their agent of action.

---

---

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Ground** – Not specifying destroys negative disad and solvency link arguments. Political implementation arguments such as politics disads and agent counterplans are destroyed.
2. **No Solvency** – There is not an entity entitled the “United States Federal Government” which passes policy, your affirmative never happens.
3. **Education** – Allowing implementation arguments increases education over the political process and certain agencies are designated the authority to pass certain policies. This is the best model for real world education.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**

## 2NC: A-Spec

**The affirmative has failed to specify either the Executive, Legislative or Judicial branch of the United States Federal Government. This is bad for a few reasons:**

1. **Ground** – specifying allows the affirmative to spike out of our disad links and solvency turns by claiming they use a particular agent in the 2AC. This functionally justifies affirmative conditionality, which is uniquely worse than negative conditionality because they get to speak first. It leaves negatives one speech behind and allows affirmative plan amendments. This justifies 2NC counterplans.
2. **They Don't Solve** – because their plan never gets passed; there is no such entity as the United States Federal Government that passes policies.
3. **Education** – The Senate signs treaties, the President issues Executive Orders, and the Courts are responsible for matters of law. We can never learn about the intricacies of the duties of each branch if we don't allow specification. Specification increases education over governmental process and implementation procedures, which is important to understanding how our government operates.

**Our argument is a voting issue for the reasons above and competitive equity because the way the affirmative has written their plan text has unduly balanced the debate in their favor.**



## 1NC: O-Spec

### A. Interpretation:

**The affirmative must defend all 3 branches of the United States Federal Government.**

**We have definitional support – ‘the’ is a mass noun.**

**American Heritage Dictionary 2000**

Used before a singular noun indicating that the noun is generic: The wolf is an endangered species.

### B. Violation: The affirmative specifies an agent.

---

---

### C. Reasons to Prefer:

1. **Ground** – specifying allows them to choose tiny, unpredictable agents that we won't be prepared to debate and they can strategically change. No ground loss because they can still read their agent counterplans because they can pick out of all the other parts of the USFG and defend a particular agent.
2. **Doesn't justify extra-topicality** – their interpretation allows them to claim specific agent advantages that go beyond the scope of the topic. Extra-topicality is voting issue because it proves the resolution insufficient and is a no-cost burden for the affirmative.
3. **Agent Counterplans are Bad for Debate** - they moot any education over the substance of the policy and shift the debate over semantic differences. It leaves the affirmative one speech behind because it allows the negative to capture all of the 1ACs advocacy and crushes their ability to use their 1AC as offense.

**D. Topicality is a voter for fairness and competitive equity. Topicality should be viewed as a debate of competing interpretations to prevent judge intervention.**

## 2NC: O-Spec

**The affirmative must defend all 3 branches of the United States Federal Government. The violation is that the affirmative fails to do this and specifies a particular agent. This is bad for a few reasons:**

1. **Ground** – they allow an infinitely regressive number of agents, multiplying the topic at least by 30 different agents for each branch's departments. It makes it impossible to research that number of disad links and counterplan arguments against every implementation actor.
2. **They are Extra-Topical** – the advantages they claim off of specifying a particular agent are extra-topical and should be rejected.
3. **Agent Counterplans are Bad** – specifying justifies agent counterplans. These are bad because they allow the negative to capture all of the 1ACs offense, leaving affirmative's one speech behind. They destroy education and focus the debate instead on semantics.

**Our argument is a voting issue for the reasons above and competitive equity because the way their plan text was written has already unduly influenced the way this debate has happened.**

